

6-1-1986

***Catholicism in South Florida, 1868-1968* by Michael J. McNally**

Randall M. Miller

St. Joseph's University in Philadelphia

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarcommons.usf.edu/tampabayhistory>

Recommended Citation

Miller, Randall M. (1986) "*Catholicism in South Florida, 1868-1968* by Michael J. McNally," *Tampa Bay History*. Vol. 8 : Iss. 1 , Article 10.

Available at: <https://scholarcommons.usf.edu/tampabayhistory/vol8/iss1/10>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Open Access Journals at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Tampa Bay History by an authorized editor of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact scholarcommons@usf.edu.

viewer. However, some pages are so crowded with unexplained photos that they look like they should be in a high school or college yearbook.

The picture “Credits” page is a small disaster. No credit is given for over 20 photos. Credit was usually given to a local library or society instead of the real origin of a photo. Some page numbers are listed up to four times, with no way of knowing which picture gets which credit. On occasion, a photo receives more than one credit.

Some picture choices are unfortunate. Why does the author use a photo of a present-day man and his wife dressed in Civil War garb to begin a chapter when a picture of a genuine Pinellas confederate, John Bethell, is readily available? Another photo, of a 1980’s Civil War reenactment group, has a false and misleading caption as though it were an 1860’s picture. Besides such inadequate picture choices, the book also suffers from lack of appropriate maps to coincide with the many “then and now” geographical descriptions.

No pictorial history can be devoid of interest and fascination, even if Clio, the Goddess of History, should withhold her sponsorship.

Ernest F. Dibble.

Catholicism in South Florida, 1868-1968. By Michael J. McNally. Gainesville. 1984. University Presses of Florida. Tables. Bibliography. Pp. xx, 316. Paper. \$13.95.

According to McNally, the story of south Florida Catholicism begins in 1868, when the first group of religious women came to the region, when Cuban exiles arrived in Key West in significant numbers, and when parish life became somewhat stabilized. The crude, even rough frontier Catholicism, however, lacked a centralized diocesan structure and sufficient priests to serve the small, but growing Catholic population, giving laity unusual latitude in organizing and directing local religious activities. In many ways, the ethnically diverse pioneer Key West Catholic community (composed of blacks, Cubans, and whites) set the direction and tone for much of south Florida Catholicism for two generations thereafter. The opening of Florida to development in the early twentieth century, due in part to transportation improvements, altered the scale and range of Catholic concerns, but even through the 1930s the church retained its missionary character. It was a church poor in human and material resources, with a widely-scattered population and a defensive posture in facing the dominant Protestant culture of the region.

In McNally’s eyes, the episcopacy of Joseph P. Hurley, from 1940 to 1958, affected profound changes in the church’s structure and social stance. Although uncomfortable in human relations (even children made him nervous), Hurley brought pragmatic organization, assiduous acquisition of real estate, vigorous fundraising, and close management of staff and property to the church, and thereby imparted to south Florida Catholicism a sense of destiny and self-confidence it had previously lacked. The creation of the diocese of Miami in 1958 marked a new era in south Florida Catholicism. The longitudinal division (which, among other changes, separated the Tampa area away from its Atlantic south Florida connections) led to a bitter dispute between Hurley, now bishop of the diocese of St. Augustine, and Coleman Carroll, bishop (later

archbishop) of the newly-formed Miami diocese. Their quarrels over property allocations, responsibility for debts, and staff divided the church in Florida and saddled the new diocese with heavy financial burdens. Most important, argues McNally, the Hurley-Carroll split caused Carroll and his followers to abandon their ties to the church's past interests and accomplishments in south Florida. Carroll focused attention on his administration and cultivated a myth of a new Catholicism in south Florida. Unfettered by history and tied only by land to its mother diocese, Miami now made its own history by rooting its actions in current concerns rather than in any understanding of the past.

As McNally shows so well, the new diocese had enough new concerns to occupy its time and talents. Especially troubling was the increasingly large and diverse Hispanic population crowding into south Florida. Indeed, the Cuban challenge, which involved assimilating large numbers of Cuban refugees who were Catholic in culture but distrustful of or at least indifferent to the church in practice, taxed traditional south Florida's Catholicism spiritually and materially. Despite efforts to reach out to the new population through social service agencies and voluntary associations, the church never won its loyalties. Meanwhile, the church also struggled to serve the needs of its other constituents. In schools, vocations, and social outreach, the church failed to impose a uniform Catholic morality or identity. Regarding the Cubans at least, many continued to practice their popular religions, such as *santeria*, or adapted Cuban Catholicism to the new environment. Changing liturgical practices and attitudes toward lay roles in the church, among other influences wrought by Vatican II, further complicated the ministry in the ethnically diverse Miami diocese. The tensions between native and Cuban Catholics mirrored the unsettled state of south Florida Catholicism as it entered a new stage of development under Vatican II, new leadership, and a growing, but divided "Catholic" population.

Although McNally's account hardly mentions Tampa, or other southern Catholic communities for that matter, his book's importance transcends its limited geographical confines. By neatly charting the uneven course of Catholicism in the south Florida setting, McNally reminds us that the institutional development and social composition of the Catholic church, or any church, cannot be understood outside of their particular geographical and cultural environment. McNally's seeming "bricks-and-mortar" emphasis on bishops and church building in fact helps to show how the physical construction of the church as an institution and the personalities of church leaders both shaped the character and focused the social vision of Catholicism. In those ways, his book speaks to Tampa's history and present concerns as fully as it does to those of any American Catholic community. McNally shows, then, that the presentism of Coleman Carroll notwithstanding, history still matters.

Randall M. Miller

Governor LeRoy Collins of Florida: Spokesman of the New South. By Tom R. Wagy. University, Alabama. 1985. University of Alabama Press. Pp. 264. Index. Cloth. \$22.50.

In contrast to its deep South neighbors of Georgia and Alabama, Florida has enjoyed a reputation as a progressive state. The restrictive economic and racial patterns that created the image of Dixie as a backward and repressive region also applied in Florida, but the Sunshine