10-1-1995


CUTR

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarcommons.usf.edu/cutr_reports

Scholar Commons Citation
https://scholarcommons.usf.edu/cutr_reports/80

This Technical Report is brought to you for free and open access by the CUTR Publications at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in CUTR Research Reports by an authorized administrator of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact scholarcommons@usf.edu.
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

METRO-DADE TRANSIT AGENCY

APPENDIX A

EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE -
1991 STRATEGIC MANAGEMENT PLAN OBJECTIVES

October 1995

Prepared for:
Metro-Dade Transit Agency
Miami, Florida

Prepared by:
Center for Urban Transportation Research
University of South Florida
College of Engineering, ENB 118
4202 E. Fowler Avenue
Tampa, Florida 33620-5350

Project Manager
Joel Volinski

Project Staff
Dan Boyle             Rebecca Rahami
Dennis Hinebaugh      Cherie Reid
Victoria Perk         Joel Rey
Vicky Zambito

Special Thanks to TERRY MCKINLEY of MDTA
# Table of Contents

- List of Tables .................................................. A5
- List of Figures .................................................. A5
- Introduction ..................................................... A7
- Strategic Excellence Position No. 1 - Market Needs
  - Objectives ..................................................... A9
  - Strategies .................................................... A14
- Strategic Excellence Position No. 2 - Human Resources
  - Objectives ..................................................... A24
  - Strategies .................................................... A29
- Strategic Excellence Position No. 3 - Funding
  - Objectives ..................................................... A37
  - Strategies .................................................... A41
- Strategic Excellence Position No. 4 - Operating Performance
  - Objectives ..................................................... A46
  - Strategies .................................................... A54
- Strategic Excellence Position No. 5 - Financial/Administrative Performance
  - Objectives ..................................................... A61
  - Strategies .................................................... A65
- Strategic Excellence Position No. 6 - Public/Governmental Relations
  - Objectives ..................................................... A69
  - Strategies .................................................... A74
- Strategic Excellence Position No. 7 - Capital Construction
  - Objectives ..................................................... A79
  - Strategies .................................................... A82
- MDTA Partial Strategic Framework - Exhibit I .................. A87
- Bibliography ................................................... A91
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

List of Tables

Table A-1  Passenger Trips Per Capita ................................ A10
Table A-2  FY 1993 Federal Capital Funding ............................... A39
Table A-3  FY 1994 Federal Capital Funding ............................... A39
Table A-4  Metrorail Service Delivery Performance ...................... A49
Table A-5  Metromover Service Delivery Performance .................... A49
Table A-6  Metrobus On-Time Preventive Maintenance Inspections .... A50
Table A-7  Safety Performance .......................................... A52
Table A-8  Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour .......................... A54
Table A-9  Farebox Recovery Ratio ...................................... A61
Table A-10 Operating Expense per Passenger Trip ........................ A62
Table A-11 Standby Time ............................................. A64
Table A-12 Percentage of Pay Hours Spent Not Driving ............... A64
Table A-13 Lost Workdays Due to Industrial Accidents .............. A64
Table A-14 Fiscal Efficiency .......................................... A68
Table A-15 Changes in the Image of MDTA System .................... A72
Table A-16 Dade County Program of Interrelated Projects .......... A81

List of Figures

Figure A-1 Passenger Complaints ...................................... A11
Figure A-2 Paratransit Passenger Complaints ........................... A12
Figure A-3 Schedule Adherence ........................................ A47
Figure A-4 Average Miles per Mechanical Roadcall .................... A48
Figure A-5 Absence Rate ............................................. A63
INTRODUCTION

This report provides an evaluation of the progress made to date in the implementation of the MDTA Strategic Management Plan (SMP) adopted in January 1991. That plan contained the following mission statement as the primary guide for MDTA action:

To meet the mobility needs of our customers for high quality transit services which take them where and when they want to go, consistent with prudent business practices.

To accomplish this mission, seven Strategic Excellence Positions were established, which were further refined by identifying 30 (mostly) quantifiable objectives. Fifty-four strategies were then adopted that were intended to help the MDTA accomplish the 30 objectives. The framework for the MDTA Strategic Management Plan is provided as Exhibit 1. The purpose of this report is to evaluate the progress made to date in the implementation of that plan. In many cases, the objectives called for progress to be made within one year of the adoption of the plan. This evaluation will track the progress made on each objective through Fiscal Year (FY) 1993, and through FY 1994 where data is available. The report identifies each Strategic Excellence Position and provides an evaluation of the progress made toward each corresponding objective and strategy.
STRATEGIC EXCELLENCE POSITION NO. 1:
MARKET NEEDS

To provide transit solutions to meet the specific identified needs of a diverse market within the context of the overall transportation system.

OBJECTIVES:

1. To increase per capita ridership systemwide by 3.5 percent for bus and 4 percent for rail by October 1991.

Ridership did not grow at the rate hoped for during the first year of the Strategic Management Plan for two reasons. First, the base fare was increased from $1.00 to $1.25 after the Dade County electorate voted against a one-penny sales tax (transit surtax) in a November 1990 referendum. Second, illegal jitneys began operating in the same corridors as MDTA's best bus routes, offering service for $1.00 and siphoning off many passengers who previously used MDTA services. As a result, per capita bus ridership decreased 8.3 percent while rail ridership managed to increase by 2.3 percent during the first year of the SMP.

Per capita passenger trips decreased for both bus and rail during 1992. However, two events occurred in 1992 that laid the foundation for increased ridership in 1993. First, Metro-Dade County obtained favorable legislation that allowed the county to strictly enforce jitney activities and limit their operation to only those areas where they had historically provided service. Second, Hurricane Andrew had a powerful effect on transportation patterns as thousands of households lost the use of their homes, and many lost their cars as well. Many people in these circumstances turned to public transportation as a primary or secondary means of mobility. Public transportation use throughout the southeast Florida region increased, as many Dade County residents moved to communities further north for replacement housing.

When evaluated over a four-year period from 1990 through 1993, per capita passenger trips have increased by 13.8 percent for directly operated motorbus and 7.9 percent for rail, according to Section 15 reports (Table A-1). This positive accomplishment is tempered by the fact that virtually all the increase occurred in FY 1993 after Hurricane Andrew. Systemwide per capita ridership actually declined each year from 1989 through 1992. Contributing reasons for this were jitney competition, increased fares and less reliable bus service (see Objective #38) caused in part by bus
mechanic personnel shortages and aging equipment. Preliminary ridership data for 1994 indicates a slight decrease in ridership systemwide from 1993. The positive aspect of this development is that MDTA appears to be retaining most of the new riders attracted during 1993.

Table A-1
Passenger Trips Per Capita

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Percent Change 1990-1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metrobus</td>
<td>28.74</td>
<td>28.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail</td>
<td>7.03</td>
<td>7.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It should be noted that transit agencies operating in communities with highly transient populations (such as Dade County) have an extra challenge in marketing their services to an ever-changing population. Transit agencies operating in such environments have to market their services effectively to simply retain current ridership levels. MDTA's marketing budget is relatively small by industry standards, and unfilled vacancies in the Marketing Division hampered the agency's ability to realize consistent annual gains in ridership.

2. To improve customer satisfaction by 10 percent by June 1992 as measured by a baseline study.

The baseline study noted in the objective was not undertaken due to the shortfall of funds caused by the failed transit surtax vote in November of 1990. Consequently, some other indicators must be reviewed to provide some insights into MDTA customer satisfaction. MDTA categorizes all complaints received on bus and rail services and reports on their status in monthly, quarterly and annual reports. Those records indicate that complaints decreased from an average of 435 per month in FY 1990 to 358 per month in FY 1992, thereby satisfying the original objective. However, complaints increased to an average of 558 per month in FY 1994 (Figure A-1). The largest increases in complaints were in the "late" and "no show" categories. While the objective was met for June of 1992, the backslide experienced in 1993 and 1994 negated those advances. The probable cause of the increase in the complaints was the agency's shortcomings in maintaining the bus fleet which resulted in missed pullouts, mechanical breakdowns and late service.
Complaints regarding paratransit service have also increased from a level of 520 a month in 1992 to almost 1,500 per month in 1994 (Figure A-2). According to the "FY 1994 Annual Performance Report" produced by MDTA, "the volume and increases in the service related complaints are primarily in the 'late pick-up' and 'late return' subcategories."
Another indicator of customer satisfaction is available from the 1994 Tracking Study performed for the MDTA by Behavioral Science Research. That study measured customer satisfaction in various categories. A survey was performed during the months of February and March of 1994 utilizing responses from 1,500 randomly selected households in Dade County. The summary conclusions on customer satisfaction from this report were as follows:
Satisfaction levels among riders are generally higher than in previous years, continuing a trend noted in the 1991 study. Most of the increases have occurred among rail riders and dual rail/bus riders, with the only decreases in satisfaction levels occurring among bus riders. The availability of maps and schedules, on time arrivals and departures and the courtesy of bus drivers were the areas that showed a decrease in the level of satisfaction from the 1991 study. It should be noted that these decreases in satisfaction are small and the overall levels of satisfaction are much higher than they were in 1988.

These findings don't necessarily conflict with MDTA's own complaint records. They are similar in noting a decrease in customer satisfaction with bus services. Again, the difficulties with maintaining the bus fleet no doubt contributed to this negative feedback from surveyed customers. The positive survey findings are also consistent with a feeling throughout the agency (gained from seven different meetings with over 75 MDTA employees and a survey of employee opinions conducted by Kaset International) that MDTA does have higher regard for customer service and an improved image in the community.

3. To increase transit's share of passenger trips.

The only available statistic that reliably measures this condition is the modal split statistic which is one of the outputs of the long-range planning model used to develop the Transportation Development Plan. As contained in Technical Report 2, an appendix to the last long-range plan model run, published in 1990, the modal split statistic was 3 percent. This statistic will not be recalculated and published until the 1995 version of the long-range transportation plan is produced.

Passenger trips per capita can serve as a reasonable statistic to indicate market penetration. The total passenger trips per capita for MDTA increased by 17.5 percent from 1990 to 1993. This figure is very encouraging, but final conclusions on progress in this objective will not be available until the transportation model is updated in late 1995. It is reasonable to say that even a 17.5 percent increase in transit trips per capita would not make a noticeable change in modal split. It is also fair to say that without substantial increases in transit service, it is unrealistic to expect a positive shift in modal split. Again, the failure of the transit surtax referendum made any substantial progress toward this objective unlikely. Perhaps a more realistic goal under the prevailing conditions is to avoid losing market share.
The Tracking Study produced in 1994 by Behavioral Science Research concluded that more Dade County residents are using public transit than ever before. This report cautioned, however, that the increase in ridership has been among persons who use public transportation twice a month or more, but less than once a week. The report notes that at the same time, there has been a decrease in the percentage of persons using public transportation on a weekly basis. This may be the result of successfully encouraging passengers to use transit to attend special events (which the marketing program has emphasized) while losing some regular passengers to other modes.

4. To have a complete model of the mobility needs of Dade County residents that is not more than three years old by 1993.

Part of the initial intent of this objective was for MDTA to become a comprehensive agency for "mobility management" which would include car/vanpooling, congestion management planning, transportation demand management techniques, etc. Most of those activities have become the responsibility of the Dade County Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO). Consequently, MDTA has not developed a complete model of all mobility needs of Dade County residents. The Dade County MPO served as the contract manager for the development of a "Transitional Study" that focused on transportation demands within six corridors in Dade County recognized as candidates for high performance transit services. That study was completed in 1993 and has served the agency well in determining the costs and benefits of different transit options in the six corridors. However, a "complete model" of mobility needs of all Dade residents was not developed.

STRATEGIES:

5. Focus on providing accurate and reliable customer information in a "user friendly" format and obtain feedback on its usefulness.

MDTA has taken many steps to satisfy this objective since 1990. A computer-assisted customer information system was installed in the Public Services Division by the Megadyne Corporation. The purpose of this system is to allow customer information personnel to enter customer trip planning requests into a computer which is programmed to provide accurate and consistent information on the best routing and scheduling options. MDTA is also in the process of installing and testing an automated voice response system which will provide customers with accurate information on routes, scheduling, fares, pass sale outlet locations and other commonly asked questions. Requests for passenger information materials to be sent by mail can also be handled automatically. This will give MDTA personnel more time to personally assist customers with more complex requests. The
automated voice response system will also be available 24 hours a day, seven days a week, thereby expanding customer service hours considerably.

Progress was also made on installing an automated vehicle location (AVL) system scheduled for completion in March of 1996. When completed, this system will provide MDTA personnel and the public with real-time information on the schedule adherence of all buses on all routes.

MDTA has opened two new customer service centers at the Omni transit center and at the Civic Center. These centers provide opportunities for passengers to obtain maps, schedules, fare media and personalized assistance from 7:30 a.m. to 4:30 p.m. Monday through Friday. An information van serves Miami Beach and the 163rd Street Shopping Center, but at this time provides only passenger information.

Major opportunities became available to provide accurate and reliable information to a substantial market segment when Dade County repealed the "English only" ordinance. Since that repeal, MDTA has produced a number of printed materials in Spanish, including MDTA's Rider's Handbook, Elderly and Disabled Handbook, and promotional materials for the opening of the Metromover extensions.

The MDTA marketing budget is relatively small, and there is a general feeling among employees that present efforts to provide information on the transit system need to be increased. This is consistent with the finding of the BSR Tracking Study that noted a decrease in the level of satisfaction in the availability of maps and schedules. Providing this information in more than one language will become increasingly important due to the tremendous amount of foreign immigration that continues to dominate Dade County's population dynamics.

The marketing staff has worked to improve the availability of basic transit information by providing two-sided passenger display cases at over 40 major transfer points throughout the system. In addition, there has been greater effort to improve signage at major facilities. Staff from marketing are working more closely with engineers and contractors at the project design level to recommend improved passenger information signage at new facilities such as the Dadeland North parking garage and the south corridor Busway. These efforts will be even more productive since MDTA is now certified to be project manager for future construction projects funded through the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), heretofore managed by FDOT.

---

*Strategic Excellence Position No. 1: Market Needs*
6. Follow-up on positive and negative feedback relating to employee actions impacting customer relations and satisfaction.

MDTA does not keep centralized records of the disposition of cases of employees who interact noticeably well or poorly with customers. All complaints are recorded by the Public Services Division and processed to appropriate managers for investigation and corrective action, if necessary. The paratransit operations staff receives complaints and follows through with the contractor to resolve problems and prevent their recurrence.

All employee commendations received through the Public Services Division are also forwarded to that employee's section management. This information is shared with the employee, and a record is placed in his or her personnel file. MDTA has established a process of recognizing "employees of the month" for bus operations, rail operations, maintenance and at-large categories. Those so recognized are honored by having their pictures placed in trains and buses for the month and by being commended in front of the county commission's Transportation Committee.

The MDTA has improved its ability to gain customer feedback on employee performance through the planned installation of the automated voice response system noted above. Customers who can't reach the Public Services Division during normal working hours will be able to leave a message on the new system.

The MDTA has also taken the first steps to follow up on the overall concerns regarding customer service. Again, the Tracking Study noted a small decrease in the level of satisfaction with the courtesy of bus operators. Kaset International conducted a survey of employee attitudes in 1993. Based on the results of that survey, the agency intends to establish training courses emphasizing the importance of customer service.

7. Develop and implement a coordinated, fully integrated transportation system with easy transfers between modes and other elements of the area's transportation system.

MDTA has given special attention to this objective. Representatives of the agency meet monthly with representatives of Tri-Rail to discuss how to best coordinate feeder services in the interest of mutual customers. They have also contributed to the funding and development of a regional fare coordination study intended to standardize fare policies throughout southeast Florida. In 1994, MDTA modified its transfer policies for bus passengers to allow them to enjoy the same transfer privileges as heavy rail passengers who transfer to and from Metromover. The new transit center
at the Omni provides far superior transfer opportunities for bus passengers who had to walk a number of blocks and cross streets to accomplish their transfers.

A new parking garage was completed and opened at the Dadeland North Metrorail station, allowing the occupants from 2,000 vehicles to conveniently change modes. All of the major transit corridor improvements are being designed to provide similar opportunities for parking garages at key intercepts such as the Palmetto Expressway, Gratigny Parkway and Florida Turnpike. Successful efforts have been made to "mainstream" specialized transportation services (STS) and Medicaid paratransit passengers to regular fixed-route transit by offering free transit passes to those who select regular transit over paratransit.

Of course, the entire MDTA system is designed to provide convenient opportunities to transfer between bus and rail (and between buses) at rail stations. In addition, MDTA is serving as a model for the nation with its Program of Interrelated Projects. The Miami Intermodal Center is expressly intended to maximize opportunities to transfer between numerous modes of transportation (including airport, seaport, Metrorail, Metrobus, Tri-Rail, high-speed rail, taxis, automobiles, etc.) at one location near the Miami International Airport.

It has been difficult to realize any meaningful coordination with private jitneys in the county. One positive example is an agreement with Red Top jitneys that operate in south Dade. MDTA and Red Top accept each other’s transfers. A new difficulty that began in 1994 is the operation of large private buses that operate in the same fashion as previous smaller jitneys whose operations were declared illegal. These vehicles appear to be beyond the county's regulatory control without new legislative language that would permit the regulation of vehicles carrying more than 16 passengers.

Finally, Dade County (through its interlocal agreement with the University of South Florida) researched the feasibility of installing bicycle racks on buses to allow bicyclists the opportunity to use Metrobus. A pilot bikes-on-buses program is expected to be implemented on three bus routes by early 1996. Bicyclists may already use Metrorail during non-peak hours.

8. **Obtain more effective and focused market information** (quantitative data, focus groups, operator/driver survey and surveys of non-riders) to better understand the market's needs.

MDTA undertook a number of initiatives to keep better informed about the nature of the transit market. Tracking Studies of transit usage patterns, satisfaction and image among rider and non-rider
populations were conducted in 1991 and 1994 by Behavioral Science Research. The same company also conducted a Sales Tax Referendum Study that provided further insights into what MDTA's market regards as important.

The Center for Urban Transportation Research (CUTR) conducted the first on-board survey of MDTA passengers in nine years in 1993. This survey provided an accurate description of trip characteristics as well as the demographic and socioeconomic characteristics of MDTA's passengers. Specialized research of employees in the Brickell area resulted in operational adjustments and a better understanding of a highly transitory market. Market-based research is being performed by consultants in the northeast Dade and Kendall corridors as a follow-up to the Transition Study completed in 1993. The Service Planning and Scheduling Division created the position of transit market analyst to assist with the above noted activities as well as route analysis. Service on a number of routes (including Routes 24, 77, B, K, 83, 56, and 11) was modified in accordance with suggestions from passengers on routing, bus stop locations and scheduling. Market research demonstrated the need for further efforts to inform businesses near the north leg of Metrorail of available rail services and monthly pass discounts. Focus groups have been established on an ad hoc basis for projects such as the Kendall Area Transit (KAT) and the 27th Avenue MAX to help determine how to advertise the service and where to provide bus stops.

Information on public sentiment is also obtained during community meetings attended by MDTA representatives from the Marketing, Service Planning, Transit Systems Development and Public Services Divisions and the staff dedicated to the Transit 2020 Coalition. The information gathered from these meetings, in-house surveys, bus operators, customer service personnel and consultants could, if organized and reviewed more diligently, provide a powerful source of information for understanding Dade's transit market needs.

9. **Obtain and maintain better planning data such as ridership by segment, trip, etc.**

The Service Planning and Scheduling Division has made some advances in refining route schedules and services based on input received as part of the marketing studies noted in Strategy No. 8. Ridership data is collected in a variety of ways. Electronic fareboxes provide a significant amount of raw ridership data, but information collected in this fashion is dependent on accurate entries by all bus operators and is focused on route level performance. Hand-held data collection equipment was purchased in 1990 to facilitate ridership data collection at the route segment level, but the equipment has not proven to be as useful as originally hoped (it is regarded as largely obsolete).
There have been a number of vacancies in the transit surveyors positions, some caused by promotions and others as a result of relatively low pay and unattractive working conditions. The length of time it takes to hire someone in Dade County has added to the difficulties of obtaining sufficient planning data. CUTR has been authorized to review this subject area and develop recommendations for better methods of collecting, storing and utilizing ridership data.

10. Market transit's impact on people's mobility.

Since 1990, MDTA has taken a number of steps to market transit's impact on peoples' mobility, though this objective does not dominate a relatively small marketing program. The marketing staff has invested its limited resources in more targeted efforts such as special events and new services promotions. These efforts have resulted in MDTA being recognized as a community resource and as a partner in Dade County's cultural activities. It also appears to have resulted in attracting more people to use transit than ever before (see No. 3 above).

There are general approaches used by MDTA to emphasize the impact of transit on people's mobility. A five-minute video entitled “1994 Transportation Summit Video” provides multiple shots of horrendous traffic conditions on well recognized Dade County roads, informs the viewer that Dade is the sixth (now fourth) most congested urban area in the country, notes the cost of congestion on the price of goods and services (almost $1 billion a year) and states the negative consequences to the area's economy if this traffic congestion isn't reduced. The video also demonstrates the efficiency of moving people by transit. This video is shown at a number of different forums, and copies are provided to interested groups.

The marketing staff goes to schools and makes presentations to second graders throughout the county to highlight the many advantages of transit. Collateral materials are provided to the members of the Transit 2020 Coalition who in turn distribute materials extolling transit's virtues to numerous groups throughout the county. The marketing staff also hands out collateral materials at a number of major community events where information booths are set up.

Although MDTA utilizes the slogan “Transit beats traffic,” a limited budget prevents MDTA from saturating the market with this message. There is also a belief that generic messages have limited effects on ridership.
11. Provide real transit incentives (public and private) for peak- and base-hour travel.

Since 1991, MDTA has offered a number of new services to encourage more transit travel during peak hours. Limited stop express service has been established on Flagler Street, Biscayne Boulevard and Northwest 27th Avenue. These services were heavily promoted and passengers were allowed to ride free for a week, giving the new routes a good kick start toward success. In December of 1994, the frequency of Metrorail service was improved from 7.5 minutes in the peak and 20 minutes off-peak to 5 minutes in the peak and 15 minutes in the off-peak. Budgetary constraints have prevented MDTA from providing significant amounts of new service. However, selected routes such as Routes 77 and 8 were supplemented with additional tripper service on weekdays and Routes 3 and 16 were supplemented on weekends.

MDTA has offered incentives in the form of discounts or free fares in a number of instances. As noted above, new MAX services were introduced by allowing free travel during the first week of service. Free return tickets are provided to people who participate in charitable events such as the March of Dimes Walkathon or the Corporate Run. Perhaps the clearest example of an incentive to use transit was the “Free Fare Days” that were in effect for Metromover passengers for the first six months of operation after the opening of the Metromover extensions. Ridership on Metromover increased from approximately 10,000 passengers per weekday to almost 20,000 passengers per weekday during those months. Ridership levels have been approximately 13,000 per day since $.25 fares were reinstated.

MDTA also works with two transportation management associations (Miami Beach and Civic Center) that have the ability to provide incentives for people to use transit by offering discounted monthly passes, guaranteed ride home programs, information on transit services, etc. MDTA is in the process of utilizing a $100,000 grant to promote the employee transportation benefit program (whereby employees may receive non-taxable transit benefits with a value of up to $60 per month). In addition, MDTA has taken preliminary steps to institute a “commuter check” program. This program allows employers (or others) to purchase vouchers that can be given to employees and redeemed for transit passes or tokens. If this program can gain popularity and become a well known employee benefit, there will be enormous incentives available for more people to use transit. In keeping with a growing trend of cooperation, MDTA should share their progress on commuter checks with the other transit providers in the region. Perhaps a more regional distribution of such vouchers will result in greater transit use in Dade.
12. Promote prudent use of the car as part of the overall transit campaign.

It almost goes without saying that the vast majority of households enjoy having an automobile for freedom of mobility. While advocating greater use of transit, public transportation agencies must acknowledge this fact and the fact that existing land use patterns don't always lend themselves to the design of convenient transit services. The best opportunity to attract automobile owners to use transit is to provide convenient opportunities for changing modes.

In that regard, MDTA has aggressively pursued the provision of parking facilities at major transit centers. Since 1991, new parking facilities have been constructed at the Dadeland North and South Miami Metrorail stations, allowing thousands of people to use their cars to access the transit system inexpensively. Discussions regarding commuter parking for the Busway have been started with owners of the Cutler Ridge shopping center. However, it appears there will be minimal opportunities to park a car and transfer to the Busway at any other location. MDTA is also working on a joint development with Mt. Sinai Hospital to develop a bus transit center and parking facility where modes could be changed.

The Program of Interrelated Projects incorporates this same philosophy by projecting major parking facilities at key intercepts with major highways such as the Palmetto Expressway, the Gratigny Parkway and the Florida Turnpike.

The various MAX services established since 1991 allow people to access semi-express service at numerous locations. This provides incentives for people to use transit rather than their cars by offering an inexpensive service that is competitive with automobile travel times in those corridors and is accessible at many locations. MDTA is now working with Florida Power and Light on a project that would very creatively demonstrate prudent use of the car. This project will make rental electric vehicles available at transit stations to allow transit users to complete portions of their trips in environmentally sound cars. This is a project that acknowledges the advantages a car can offer in terms of flexibility, yet reduces miles traveled by single occupancy vehicles by encouraging a major portion of certain trips to be accomplished through transit.

13. Develop and implement a strategic marketing plan based on market needs and wants within the confines of county policies and resources.

The MDTA Marketing Division develops an annual workplan that describes the numerous activities the section will engage in for the upcoming year. These activities are developed after reviewing...
information from marketing research such as the Tracking Study. It is an excellent document for planning the allocation of budgetary and personnel resources. It also allows all others in the agency to know what the marketing staff will be involved in during the course of the year.

However, it falls short of being a strategic marketing plan for the agency. It addresses how marketing dollars and staff will be utilized, but it does not address what service should be provided to realize the goals of the mission statement. Other sections of the agency work on such matters, but there does not appear to be one document that incorporates the elements of a service and marketing strategy for MDTA. This may be one reason many employees expressed a desire for more information on the direction of the agency. There does not seem to be a clearly communicated, unifying strategy for what the agency hopes to accomplish with its resources. This was also noted in the Kaset survey findings report, which stated:

Most employees are concerned about everyday matters such as job security, wages and working conditions. However, they are also interested in knowing where their organization is headed. It is interesting that management and non-management employees at Metro-Dade Transit seem to feel that they are not informed about the future of the organization.

14. **Implement necessary interim steps to improve the telemarketing program.**

This strategy was not implemented due either to budgetary constraints or reconsideration of its value.

15. **Review historical marketing strategies and utilize results to improve future strategies.**

The MDTA marketing staff definitely reviews the effectiveness of its various marketing techniques and avoids using techniques that have shown minimal results. Targeted marketing for special events and new services have proven successful. Tracking studies show that more people than ever before have used transit as a result of being attracted through targeted marketing. As noted earlier, promotions of new MAX services resulted in good ridership from their beginning. Direct mail has worked in such instances. The promotions for Metromover helped ridership escalate from 10,000 passengers per day to over 20,000 during the months when fares were suspended.

Perhaps the most important lesson the Marketing Division has realized is that no amount of advertising or promotions will overcome substandard service. In fact, service that is unreliable
undermines the credibility of any future marketing effort. Due to problems with bus maintenance, services such as the Breeze (late night minibus service to Miami Beach) and feeder service in the Port of Miami suffered from missed trips and were ultimately discontinued. The Service Planning and Marketing staffs will not be enthusiastically received as partners in future joint ventures with outside parties unless the reality of bus service matches the positive image Marketing portrays.
STRATEGIC EXCELLENCE POSITION NO. 2:  
HUMAN RESOURCES

To provide a productive, participative, safe, challenging and enriching work environment which provides equal opportunity to all employees who work towards achieving a common vision.

OBJECTIVES:

16. To demonstrably improve MDTA's workforce by June 1, 1992.

This objective is difficult to evaluate, since it contains no specific means of measuring progress. However, such an objective would imply the agency would make concerted efforts to carefully select new employees, provide ongoing training and professional development opportunities to enhance skills and communicate effectively with its employees to keep them informed of agency programs and progress so they might perform consistently with the common vision.

A number of factors have limited MDTA's ability to achieve all aspects of this objective. First, MDTA has been operating within severe budget constraints since 1991. Although the importance of training is acknowledged, it has not been possible to do as much as everyone would like. Budgetary constraints have also lead to delays in filling vacancies, leaving the agency understaffed (including the training staff).

Second, the requirements of “13(c)” of the labor agreement with the Transit Workers Union (TWU) have caused certain efforts to be redirected. One of the initial intents of Objective No. 16 was to do a more thorough job of screening new applicants to ensure the most qualified people were hired from a large applicant pool. Based on arbitration rulings, the agency had to re-order its priorities and emphasize the provision of training for existing personnel that might be regarded as “qualifiable” for open positions, even though they might have little or no experience for the job in question.

Third, Dade County instituted a “two-tiered” hiring process that calls for offering new applicants lower salaries to start, and requires those new employees to pay a greater amount for health insurance. This has had a negative effect in recruiting and retaining employees for certain skilled
positions. It also proved to be a difficult condition for the TWU to accept in labor negotiations. Their initial refusal to accept this provision resulted in a hiring freeze imposed by the county that resulted in shortages in a number of sections, including the Bus Maintenance Division. These personnel shortages contributed to less reliable transit service on the street.

Based on these circumstances, it has been very difficult to improve MDTA's workforce demonstrably. One could argue that in certain sections, the opposite has occurred. However, MDTA has taken a number of steps to achieve the spirit of this objective in spite of these conditions. The agency has instituted a formal half-day orientation for all new employees that includes an overview of the MDTA presented by the director. Structured interviews with panels are used for selecting new applicants, rather than relying on one-on-one interviews. Applicants are more carefully screened for any criminal convictions that may be related to the type of position for which they are being considered. MDTA is one of seven transit properties in the nation participating in a research program (BOSS) designed to identify which bus operator candidates have the right character traits to maintain high standards in safety, customer relations and attendance. New training personnel were added, emphasizing improved supervisory practices and skills.

Kaset International's survey of MDTA employees found that most employees believe that management considers training important to the organization. Since 1991, MDTA has added two staff members to provide training for all employees in a variety of non-technical subjects such as time management, writing skills, customer service techniques, etc. This central staff also provides training in subjects that represent mandates such as random drug testing policies, substance abuse training and ADA implementation. These opportunities supplement other supervisory training programs offered by the county. Tuition reimbursement is available to county employees who take college courses related to their field. Until recently, MDTA employees could also enroll in a Transportation Specialist Certificate program offered by Florida International University. At least four members of MDTA management served as faculty in this program since 1991.

MDTA is pursuing the opportunity to establish a program with Miami Dade Community College, Baker Aviation, and other technical schools that will provide training for employees who wish to advance in the maintenance field. MDTA Employee Relations staff and representatives of the TWU and operational managers are currently working on the various aspects of defining a career ladder program for maintenance personnel, including the development of minimum qualifications and precise job requirements. The driving force behind this program is the need to provide quality services within the procedural framework of the 13(c) provisions that allow TWU members who are "qualifiable" to have the first opportunities for open positions represented by the TWU.
In spite of all these efforts, training was identified as a weakness by a number of MDTA employees participating in strategic planning focus group sessions conducted by CUTR during 1994. Some expressed frustration with limited opportunities to attend national conferences due to budgetary constraints. Perhaps a brochure identifying all the training that is available during the course of the year would help employees realize the fairly extensive training opportunities that do exist within the county and MDTA. Such a brochure is not produced at the present time.

In regard to improving teamwork and employee information, a meeting schedule was established in 1991 that called for weekly top management meetings, monthly senior staff meetings and quarterly general staff meetings. The schedule for those meetings was maintained in the years immediately following the adoption of the plan, but not over the most recent 18 months. In sessions dealing with the update of the SMP, members of senior staff were unanimous in expressing their desire for these meetings to be continued. This was consistent with an overall desire to see all forms of communication with employees improved.

17. To improve upon a set of baseline measures, employees' perceptions regarding constructive discipline and reward, morale and job safety factors by 1992.

Due to budgetary constraints, survey efforts to establish employee opinion baselines were not performed in 1991 or 1992. In November of 1993, Kaset International conducted a survey of 307 MDTA employees (22 managers from customer service and 285 bus operators) as part of a Service Quality Assessment (SQA) of the agency. That survey focused on customer service and employees' perceptions of MDTA's performance in that area. The survey concluded that MDTA employees demonstrate an overwhelming sense of pride in working for Metro-Dade Transit, and they feel that MDTA is moving in the right direction concerning customer service.

The survey showed that bus operators believed employees who do not provide good customer service experience negative consequences, but managers believe there is no consistent system for disciplining employees for inappropriate behavior.

The Kaset survey did not ask a clear question measuring employee morale. During the seven focus group meetings conducted by CUTR, each individual was asked to rate the morale of their division and the agency on a scale of “1” to “10” (“1” for low morale and “10” for high morale). The morale for different divisions of the agency ranged from “1” to “8,” while the agency as a whole was given a rating of approximately “4.” This was not a scientific survey, but regardless of what division the
focus group participants worked in, the rating of “4” for the agency as a whole was consistently provided.

It should also be noted that during a CUTR-facilitated focus group comprised of “front-line” personnel, bus operators expressed their concern for personal security while in service. They mentioned the changing nature of society and their desire for whatever assistance the department could provide. MDTA is in the process of installing an automated vehicle location system and a new 800-Megahertz radio system which will provide better communication opportunities to improve personal security for operators and passengers. MDTA has also begun a demonstration project of installing video cameras on buses to deter and record any inappropriate behavior, including aggressive behavior and assaults.

18. To achieve objectives stated in the affirmative action plan.

MDTA established a three-year affirmative action plan with six major objectives in 1991. The agency has done very well in accomplishing most of those objectives during that time. The Fair Employment Practices (FEP) section of the department was established in 1991. That staff put in place a system to provide a continuing and ongoing review of personnel. This assured careful, thorough and systematic considerations of the job qualifications of known minority and female applicants and/or employees for job vacancies filled either by hiring or promotions, and for training opportunities offered or available within the agency. Goals for hiring minorities and females are established countywide, and all managers have information on available candidates prior to selection through an FEP recruitment checklist. All managers are held accountable for their selections through EEO achievement reports developed as part of an EEO compliance monitoring system. The achievement reports are shared with the agency director who bases his evaluation of managers, at least in part, on their success in promoting the affirmative action goals.

The second objective was to establish an EEO ad hoc committee to help the FEP staff design and implement affirmative action programs. This committee was established, comprised of 21 members including all of the assistant general managers; a cross section of the rank and file; and the local presidents of the GSA, TWU and AFSCME. The committee also helps to determine if the agency is meeting its affirmative action goals. They designed the programs described in objectives No. 3 and No. 4 (below).

The third objective was to provide training in seven subject areas of affirmative action to the entire supervisory staff of the MDTA. Due to the difficulties associated with scheduling over 350
supervisory personnel from six locations involved in multiple specialties working in a 24-hour-a-day agency, only four of the seven subject areas have been covered in training workshops. The FEP staff intends to complete training in the remaining three subject areas in 1995.

Considerable success was realized in the fourth objective of hiring more females for the bus operator position. The percentage of female bus operators in MDTA has increased to 14.3 percent of all employees within that job classification.

The fifth objective was to establish a mentorship program. This program relies on the participation of volunteers. Of the 18 pairs of mentors and mentorees originally established, 14 remain active. The inactive pairs are hindered by different work locations or scheduling difficulties. The mentor/mentoree relationships are designed to last for one year, but pairs can continue for longer than that after the FEP staff reviews their progress and prospects. Participants generally meet on their own time. The guidelines for the program will probably be tightened to help ensure a greater chance for productive mentoring relationships.

The sixth objective was to develop a skills development program targeting females interested in programs such as vehicle maintenance. This objective is intended to be patterned after an apprentice program. A bus mechanic preparation program has been established with eight females among 25 participants. These bus mechanic trainees participate for two days a week (one day on county time and one day on their own time). This program is designed to provide the training necessary to prepare participants for taking the bus mechanic test. One female candidate has successfully completed this bus mechanic preparation program.

The programs mentioned above, in addition to others undertaken by the agency, have allowed MDTA to make great strides in promoting fair and equal employment at all levels. While there are still classifications of jobs that underutilize females and minorities, many steps have been taken to change those conditions over time. One such action was the establishment of a management internship program. This program is designed to create an upward mobility and career enhancement track for internal employees seeking hands-on management experience in operational and career fields within transit. MDTA managers who participated in the Strategic Management Plan focus groups enthusiastically endorsed the internship program. For the present, it should be noted that MDTA has achieved “Workforce 2000” in that the workforce is presently made up of 85.6 percent older workers, women, minorities, persons with disabilities and veterans.
STRATEGIES:

19. Define training requirements for all classifications and implement a comprehensive training program.

Funding to accomplish this strategy was included in the FY 1991 recommended budget which was contingent on the transit surtax. Since the tax was not approved by the voters, this strategy could not be fully implemented. Objective No. 16 describes the many training activities that have been undertaken by MDTA since 1991. In the area of vehicle maintenance, the agency is diligently working on developing comprehensive training programs that support career ladders within the agency. This is clearly the most important area for MDTA to address given the arbitration rulings dealing with 13(c), the need to improve bus service and the need to perform proper maintenance on a rail fleet that will require progressively more maintenance as it ages.

Central training staff located in the Employee Relations Division is comprised of only three people, each of whom has multiple responsibilities (including administering employee recognition programs, serving as liaison with county personnel on testing issues and training MDTA personnel in federal requirements such as ADA and drug testing procedures). This staff does its best to plan and provide training in “soft” subjects of practical value for almost any employee, but has not been provided adequate personnel or funding to develop comprehensive training programs for every classification in the agency.

20. Adopt common uniforms as appropriate to position and level.

This strategy was promoted primarily by the Rail Traffic Control section of the Rail Transportation Division. Employees of this section work in facilities that are frequently visited by the public taking tours of the Central Control office in the Government Center and the control tower at the Lehman Center. Given their exposure to the public, the manager wanted that section’s personnel to have a more professional appearance. Prior to 1991, Rail Traffic Control personnel were not subject to a dress code.

In 1992, the Rail Traffic Control section started to budget for uniforms for its yard masters, rail station monitors, and rail traffic controllers. These employees now receive sufficient supplies of white shirts/blouses, and navy blue or oxford gray slacks/skirts and blazers. The manager of the section believes this “career apparel” has not only improved the image of MDTA but has helped morale of the section as well. It promotes the sense of professionalism within the section and helps
the public identify who is responsible for these very important functions affecting employee and passenger safety.

Based on the success noted above, other sections such as the Public Services Division are now considering similar actions for their personnel that have significant personal contact with the public.

21. **Conduct comprehensive baseline and follow-up employee satisfaction surveys.**

As noted in Objective No. 17 above, no comprehensive employee satisfaction surveys have been conducted since the adoption of the Strategic Management Plan in 1991. The Service Quality Assessment performed by Kaset International in 1993 was intended to gain employees' perspectives on the agency's attention to customer service. While it does not qualify as a comprehensive employee satisfaction study, it did record information that provides MDTA management with some insights on employee satisfaction. Based on the responses to 50 survey questions and input received during focus group meetings with MDTA managers, Kaset's report offered the following recommendations:

- Stress the customer in the mission statement
- Communicate long range plans to all employees
- Promote open communication between managers
- Empower employees to make decisions
- Communicate customer feedback to employees
- Measure coworker satisfaction with the service they receive
- Provide all employees with customer relations training
- Establish clear and consistent consequences for inappropriate service-related behavior
- Recruit and hire employees who are good with customers
- Create a task force to make policies, practices, and procedures more employee and customer friendly
- Establish formal systems to prevent mistakes
- Encourage all employees to solve customer problems
- Establish a formal, consistent organization-wide recovery system
- Increase top management's contact with customers and employees
- Make public education concerning bus operations a higher priority
- Allow employees to participate in decisions that affect them
- Communicate the results of the SQA and plans to improve service to all employees

Strategic Excellence Position No. 2: Human Resources
CUTR also facilitated a series of seven focus groups with representatives from all levels of MDTA during 1994. Each group was asked to identify the agency's strengths and weaknesses. This exercise also provides some insight toward employee satisfaction. While there were many differing opinions on this subject, the following aspects were regarded as agency strengths by a broad consensus of participants:

- Dedicated and caring workforce
- Good relationship with state and federal agencies
- Improved credibility with media, community and officials
- Strong project management capabilities
- Agency direction and vision
- A growing coalition that can provide external support
- Improved stability within the agency

The following elements were regarded as agency weaknesses by a broad consensus of participants:

- Insufficient communication
- Parochial interests, particularly among top management
- Time required to hire personnel
- Two-tier salary structure
- Not enough employee recognition in the form of simple appreciation
- Confrontational management/union relationship
- Insufficient training
- Pattern bargaining during labor negotiations
- Political inconsistency
- Insufficient marketing and celebration of successes
- Relatively low morale

Neither the Kaset survey nor the focus groups facilitated by CUTR serve as a baseline for follow-up employee satisfaction surveys. However, the results of both these work products should give those involved with the update of the Strategic Management Plan some good information when identifying new goals and objectives.
22. Publish a comprehensive discipline and counseling program.

A *Transit Agency Policy and Procedure (TAPP) Manual*, dealing with the agency's policy and process for practicing progressive discipline, was written and implemented. Additionally, the Employee Relations Division conducted supervisory training sessions to better equip first- and second-line supervisors in dealing with disciplinary concerns.

There remains some concerns that discipline for infractions remains inconsistent throughout the agency. The Kaset report noted that "According to managers, there is no consistent system for disciplining employees for inappropriate behavior." This is a subject that the Labor Relations Division plans to review in 1995, particularly for the bus operations section. Establishing consistent standards of discipline for infractions might require negotiation with the TWU since it affects conditions of employment.

23. Develop and implement a responsive and achievable affirmative action plan.

Please see Objective No. 18 above.

24. Negotiate a more flexible union contract to eliminate inefficient work rules.

Absolutely no progress was made in this strategy. The most recent labor agreement negotiations with TWU (conducted in 1993) were handled by the county manager's office, not MDTA management. The negotiations were dominated by the subject of health care benefits, with the county changing from individual indemnity programs to health maintenance organizations. This subject was of such critical importance to the county budget that the county manager's office determined it would not discuss other matters such as transit work rules. This demonstrates the difficulties MDTA managers can have in accomplishing their objectives. The department must sometimes defer to the objectives of the larger organization of which it is a part. The "bigger picture" being handled by the county manager or commission can affect MDTA's ability to accomplish its more focused objectives.

At MDTA's request, CUTR conducted a study entitled "Bus Operator Productivity and Efficiency Analysis." That report identified the most inefficient provisions of the labor agreement. It also compared MDTA to its industry peers and reviewed operational practices at 12 other transit agencies. This information should prove useful in future labor agreement negotiations (the current labor agreement expires on September 30, 1996), during which MDTA can make another attempt
to modify some of the inefficient work rules now in effect. Given Dade County's new emphasis on reducing costs, there might be more support for pursuing such changes.

25. **Identify work elements with high costs which should be contracted out and take appropriate action.**

From 1991 to 1994, MDTA reviewed the possibility of contracting out certain routes and functions. Relatively little progress was made in this strategy. This was possibly due to the unsuccessful results of the Private Enterprise Participation (PEP) program conducted between November 1988 and November 1990. The goal of that demonstration project was to compare the cost and service quality of publicly and privately provided transit services. The project consisted of a head-to-head competition between MDTA and a private provider (Greyhound) on five paired, comparable routes. All ten routes were operated with similar vehicles and with an equal spare ratio. The results of the experiment were summarized by Price Waterhouse as follows:

*The results from the two-year evaluation period of this PEP Program indicated that the GLI routes were operated at a significantly lower cost than the MDTA routes (50 percent lower than MDTA's full cost and 30 percent lower than MDTA's avoidable cost). The results also indicated that the GLI routes realized significant decreases in service quality, reliability and ridership (17 percent).*

The federal government also discontinued its private enterprise policies in 1993, allowing local governments to make their own determinations of when to seek competitive proposals for transit services. The annual costs for contracted transportation services increased from $1.2 million to $1.8 million from 1991 to 1994. This represents a small portion of MDTA's $188 million annual operating budget. However, MDTA estimates that it saved a total of $4.9 million dollars from 1991 to 1994 by using Mayflower to provide service on certain routes.

Private security services have been provided by Wackenhut since 1990.

Dade County had long utilized a private contractor to provide paratransit services, but decided to change from a single-provider to a brokered system starting in 1994. Under this system, a private company is responsible for distributing or "brokering" paratransit trips among a number of subcontractors who provide the actual trips. Under this system, any number of private companies
can be eligible to serve as providers. MDTA also serves as a provider under this system. This system was only fully implemented in July of 1994, and problems were expected during the transition. Complaints about the service have increased, and the price per trip has not been reduced from the prior method of using a single provider.

MDTA has prepared a Request for Qualifications for fixed-route service. The intent is to have a list of qualified transit providers available for possible use in the future. This will accelerate the procurement process when and if these resources are desired. MDTA has used private providers on certain routes for a number of years. The Kendall Area Transit (KAT) services have been provided through private carriers since their inception. Private companies also provide service on Routes A, E, 6, 71 and the Zoobus. These represent a very small fraction of all MDTA bus services. There remains considerable opportunities to contract for a variety of services currently provided by MDTA personnel, although the 13(c) agreement with TWU will limit such opportunities and TWU is likely to resist this strategy. Serious discussions are underway to establish a “B Division” comprised of MDTA employees operating smaller vehicles for significance lower wages.

26. Evaluate “correct” staffing levels.

Mathematical models for creating proper staffing configurations for bus operators and train operators were developed and implemented. They use route and run data extracted from the transit scheduling system, coupled with data from the transit operating system (TOS) to develop a comprehensive staffing profile for train and bus operators systemwide. MDTA has awarded a contract for a new graphic scheduling system that will provide further capabilities in determining the optimum level of operators for the agency. Optimization features within the software of the latest scheduling systems choose the lowest cost staffing solution within the constraints of union rules and practices. Any number of alternatives can be entered to determine the best mix of operators for a particular line-up. These programs can answer questions of a “what if” nature such as “What if we had 200 part-timers; could they be incorporated in the line-up? Would that save money?”

There is insufficient staff to conduct comprehensive staffing level studies for all divisions of MDTA. However, a number of ad hoc studies were performed by the Management and Information Systems (MIS) Division since 1991. Included among these studies were reviews of the processes and staffing required for the Recruitment section of the Employee Relations Division, the support staff needed for the Paratransit Operations Division, and the additional staff needed to operate and maintain the Metromover extensions. The findings of those studies were shared with MDTA top
management and served as the foundation for staffing level decisions during the annual budget processes. A similar study dealing with staffing requirements for the Materials Management Division began in 1994.

27. **Continue implementation of System Safety Program Plan.**

The System Safety Program Plan (SSPP) is the formal statement of the combined tasks and activities of system safety management and engineering. These stated tasks and activities are intended to enhance operational effectiveness of the various modes of transportation by satisfying system safety requirements in a timely, cost-effective manner.

MDTA is required to have and maintain an SSPP in accordance with F.S. Chapter 341.061 for the agency, FDOT Rule 14-55 for Metrorail and Metromover and FDOT Rule 14-90 for Metrobus and non-fixed guideway service contractors. MDTA has an SSPP which has been updated since 1991 with current operations and projects, and annually certifies to the state that the agency is in conformance with its SSPP and with the rules and statute.

FDOT performed a conformance review in December of 1994. While FDOT's written report will be provided in 1995, the oral exit interview with MDTA representatives was very positive. FDOT also accepts the rail audit that is developed by APTA. The state found no issues of non-conformance in the rail system.

28. **Require management accountability and authority for budgetary performance and establish formal linkage between systemwide performance standards, divisional budgets, MBO comments and compensation.**

A “performance pay” program was designed and proposed as part of the implementation of the Strategic Management Plan in 1991. This program was designed to apply to all senior management within MDTA. The program was started with a limited number of representatives of those levels, but did not become well established throughout the agency. The external environment affecting MDTA changed considerably from 1991 to 1993. As noted earlier, the gas surtax failed in 1991, leaving the agency with far less funds than hoped for. There was no staff available to give full time attention to implementing this provision of the Strategic Management Plan. In addition, many of the objectives of the plan could not be carried out because of the need to live within a contingency budget.
New federal transportation legislation (ISTEA) passed in 1991, representing the first major change in almost 30 years, required unusual amounts of staff attention, thereby limiting time that might have been spent on implementing the Performance Pay program. In 1992, Hurricane Andrew clearly rearranged priorities within the agency. The Performance Pay plan was regarded as heavily process-oriented by those who initially were subject to the plan. Added to these difficulties was the fact that many of the managers were at or very near the top of their pay range, making a pay-for-performance system less meaningful. In the end, the program was not implemented. All managers are still evaluated each year based on their performance, but there is no consistent evaluation system in place. There does not appear to be a tightly organized effort to review the performance of senior and top managers against quantified agency service objectives.
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

STRATEGIC EXCELLENCE POSITION NO. 3:
FUNDING

To obtain inflation-sensitive, growing, long-term sources of revenue capable of fulfilling the 30-year implementation program.

OBJECTIVES:

29. To obtain $40 million annually in state capital and operating assistance.

MDTA received far less than the amount noted in the objective, particularly in the first year after the adoption of the Strategic Management Plan. In FY 1991, the state Block Grant program, as defined in F.S. 341, was put in place to provide a formula based source of operating and capital funds for local transit systems. These funds can be used for either capital or operating purposes, purely at the discretion of the local grant recipient. They can serve as the state match for federal transit capital funds. The initial year of the program provided $4,643,000 ($950,000 of which was used for capital projects and $3,693,000 for operating expenses). These amounts were supplemented by $207,000 in Urban Corridor grant dollars and $703,000 in Transportation Disadvantaged funds, for a total of $5,553,000 in state funding in FY 1991.

Total state funding remained far below the objective in FY 1992 as the Block Grant continued to be phased in by FDOT. The transit Block Grant program provided a total of $9,052,966. MDTA utilized $2,000,000 for capital purposes and $7,052,966 for operating expenses. These funds were supplemented by $1,680,000 in Urban Corridor Program funds, $125,000 in Service Development grants for the Kendall service and $853,000 for the Transportation Disadvantaged program. The total of $11,710,966, more than double the amount received in FY 1991, again fell far short of the $40 million objective.

In FY 1993, state Block Grant funds started to hit full stride, providing $14,324,000 to Dade County. An additional $179,000 in Urban Corridor funds were obtained, as well as $388,000 in state dollars for expanded park-and-ride efforts and $799,000 in Transportation Disadvantaged funds, for a total of $15,690,000 in FY 1993.
In FY 1994, MDTA received a total of $14,656,000 in state capital and operating assistance. Of that amount, $11,906,000 came from the Block Grant, $1,000,000 from the Urban Corridor Program, $478,000 from the Service Development Program and $1,272,000 from the Transportation Disadvantaged program.

In FYs 1991 and 1992, state Block Grant funds were utilized for both capital and operating purposes. In FYs 1993 and 1994, all Block Grant funds were used to support the operating side of the MDTA budget. This happened in conjunction with the passage of the five cents local option gas tax in 1993, proceeds from which can be applied to transit capital projects. Increased costs for insurance, personnel and additional service also caused the agency to rely on the Block Grant for more operating assistance.

This reduced availability of state capital funding has been addressed in a number of ways. Certain projects being completed with federal funds are being matched by private sources (e.g., Mt. Sinai transit center, Metromover Miami Herald station), while others are being matched with in-kind sources (Section 26 grant addressing graffiti) or with other local jurisdictions providing the match (Section 3 Urban Initiatives grant using funds from the City of Miami). The most significant action taken to date to provide more state/local capital match was the institution of the local option gas tax for infrastructure by vote of the county commission in 1993. Funds from the local option gas tax must be shared with the municipalities and the county's Public Works Department. Assuming that source remains available, it will ultimately generate only $5,000,000 per year in new capital funding for transit. This new revenue can be bonded and serve as the basis for providing local match toward major capital projects.

In addition, some transit projects are now being built or designed with sources of funds unavailable to transit prior to ISTEA. Examples include the South Dixie Busway (using Congestion Mitigation Air Quality [CMAQ] funds), the Palmetto Metrorail extension and an east-west corridor project using FHWA funds administered by the FDOT.

30. To obtain $50 million annually in new federal capital assistance.

The optimism caused by the passage of ISTEA did not result in the level of funding hoped for in this objective. In FY 1991, MDTA obtained a total of $12,083,000 in federal capital funds. Of this amount, $8,550,000 in capital funding was provided through the Section 9 program, while the remaining $3,533,000 was provided through the Section 3 Fixed Guideway Modernization program. MDTA lobbied very effectively for ISTEA to allow rail systems built after 1974 to be recipients of
these Section 3 funds. In FY 1992, Dade County obtained $20,542,700 in total federal capital funding, comprised of $18,488,700 in Section 9, $1,723,000 in Fixed Guideway Modernization funding and $313,000 in Section 8 funds.

Total federal capital dollars increased to $33,492,000 in FY 1993. The separate sources are shown in Table A-2.

Table A-2
FY 1993 Federal Capital Funding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Section 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Articulated Bus Grant</td>
<td>$14,386,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Fixed Guideway Modernization</td>
<td>$4,250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Mt. Sinai Transit Center</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Post Hurricane Services</td>
<td>$7,250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 9</td>
<td>$7,400,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 26 (Graffiti)</td>
<td>$106,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$33,492,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Federal capital dollars totaled $42,218,000 in FY 1994. Sources are depicted in Table A-3.

Table A-3
FY 1994 Federal Capital Funding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FHWA (Palmetto Extension)</td>
<td>$4,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Articulated Bus Grant</td>
<td>$3,698,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Fixed Guideway Modernization</td>
<td>$4,584,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Mover Amendment No. 3</td>
<td>$4,700,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Urban Initiatives</td>
<td>$2,174,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 9</td>
<td>$23,062,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$42,218,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MDTA did not realize the goal of $50,000,000 in new federal capital funding in any of the years since 1991. As noted earlier, the high hopes associated with ISTEA's federal transit funding authorization levels were never realized in terms of actual appropriations. However, Dade County officials have been active players in the drafting of federal transit legislation, and they have worked very closely with both federal and state DOT officials to develop a Program of Interrelated Projects that is designed to take advantage of the flexibility provisions of ISTEA. For example, the South Corridor Busway is being constructed by FDOT with funds from the Congestion Mitigation/Air Quality program. Dade County is diligently positioning itself to obtain hundreds of millions of federal dollars normally dedicated to highway construction for major transit projects such as the east/west corridor, the Metrorail Palmetto extension and the northeast corridor.

31. To obtain $165 million annually in locally generated, growing and dependable capital and operating assistance.

On November 6, 1990, a referendum was put before the voters of Dade County for a one-cent sales tax, revenues from which would be exclusively used for transit. The expected revenue yield of $165 million annually would support a $90 to $100 million annual operating subsidy and a $65 to $75 million annual capital expansion program consistent with the Year 2010 Long-Range Transportation Plan. MDTA management staff participated extensively in public forums to help explain the proposed uses of the funds, the proposed capital plans including expanded bus service and fixed guideway construction, and details of the agency's budget. The referendum failed, but by a smaller margin than predicted (53% to 47%).

A second referendum for a one-cent addition to the sales tax, largely for transit purposes but including other infrastructure, was defeated in November 1991. This referendum was defeated by a considerable margin. There was no active support from any of the elected officials of Dade County government, and many people feel this contributed to the defeat.

In mid-1993, the Dade County Commission exercised its option under new state legislation and voted in favor of levying an additional six-cent tax on the sale of gasoline sold in the county. State legislation clearly allows proceeds from one penny of the local option gas tax (referred to as the ninth cent) to be used for operating expenses. That penny generates approximately $8.3 million per year. Approximately half of these dollars will be used to help pay for the operating expenses associated with the extensions of Metromover, while the remaining amount will be applied to other operating deficits.
Each of the remaining five pennies generates less than the penny levied for operating expenses. They will generate approximately $7 million apiece, or a total of $35 million per year for infrastructure purposes. The county has agreed to split the proceeds from this source with municipalities in Dade on a 72/28 percent basis, leaving $25 million for Dade County infrastructure projects. Of that amount, it is expected that approximately $12 million per year will go to other public works projects in the county. This leaves about $13 million available for transit capital projects. Of this amount, $8 million will be required to cover the local and state match for FTA Section 9 and formula Section 3 grants (keeping in mind that all state Block Grant dollars are now used for operating expenses). After all these factors are applied, MDTA is left with only $5 million in new capital dollars annually from the six-cent gas tax. This amount could be used for any capital project, including the match for discretionary Section 3 grants.

There is reason to be concerned that the six-cent local option gas tax could be rescinded. The method in which the county commission approved the tax has been the subject of bitter scorn by vocal elements of the Dade County community. The possibility exists that the county commission will vote to place the question of continuing the local option gas tax on a future ballot. Given the recent experiences with referenda in Dade County noted above and the current anti-tax mood prevailing in the state and nation, these funds would be at considerable risk of being lost if they become subject to a referendum. In conclusion, in spite of many efforts, MDTA did not secure a growing and dependable source of local funding dedicated to transit.

STRATEGIES:

32. **Pursue a dedicated source of funding.**

This strategy remains a high priority for the MDTA. Of all the possible funding sources available, the one-cent general sales tax offers the largest feasible revenue source needed to finance the Program of Interrelated Projects and other service improvements. However, the voters have spoken against this proposal twice in the past four years. A one-cent sales tax referendum for more public safety facilities and services also failed as recently as November of 1994. In spite of substantial resources and a bright future, Dade County is also characterized by a large lower income population. In addition, it is generally believed that a substantial portion of the large Hispanic community is more distrustful of government. These two factors will make gaining support for higher taxes more difficult.
A special study published by BSR in September of 1994 provides some hope that public support for new transit funding might be gained if certain strategies are used. BSR conducted in-depth telephone interviews with 750 randomly selected registered voters from all precincts in Dade County. The survey concluded that up to 60 percent of those surveyed would vote for a one-cent tax increase if it resulted in more Metrorail extensions and better bus service, as well as more police on the street. A one-cent sales tax could pass if Dade County carefully targets its message to specific groups of people most likely to support transit (African-Americans; women; residents of Miami Beach, Key Biscayne, and Northeast Dade; younger respondents in favor of Metrorail extensions). BSR concluded the campaign for a new tax should be based more on door-to-door efforts than flashy advertising, and it needs to be based on solid information showing exactly how the new funds would create new services.

A dedicated source of funding remains an important objective. Portions of the recently enacted local option gas tax are not dedicated to transit by any more than resolutions of the county commission. The revenues from the local option gas tax are not restricted by law for transit applications only. The tax could be rescinded by the commission (or possibly by the electorate), or the proceeds could be directed to other transportation projects such as highways.

Another possible source of funds for transit could come from the newly created Dade County Expressway Authority. In spite of its title, the state legislation creating this authority allows revenues generated from highway tolls to be used for transit capital or operating expenses. MDTA staff was instrumental in providing transit-supportive language in the legislation creating the expressway authority.

33. Support a broad coalition of interest groups in Dade County who would support transit.

During the time the federal administration and Congress were actively developing a reauthorization of the federal transit funding programs, MDTA was extremely active in soliciting interest groups in Dade County to write to pertinent members of Congress in support of Dade's positions on the proposed ISTEA legislation. The agency director's involvement with industry interest groups, such as "Transit 2000" and "Transit Now" along with APTA and its Legislative Affairs Committee, helped to develop the basis for a broad information base to present critical funding issues effectively to local groups and organizations.
A wide variety of groups with varying perspectives and levels of interest were addressed for the primary purpose of sending firm transit support statements to Washington. Creating such a large volume (over 6,000 cards and letters) of correspondence was not the only success resulting from this effort. The time spent addressing various groups provided valuable exposure for a large number of community representatives to the critical issues facing MDTA. These efforts helped provide the foundation for the creation of a true transit coalition.

Since that effort, the Transit 2020 Coalition has been organized with over 250 members representing educational institutions, environmental groups, business associations, civil rights organizations, political clubs, transportation consultants, realtors, human service agencies and many others. The coalition is still in its initial stages, but it now has a Board of Directors, officers, four regional committees, subcommittee structures and goals and objectives. The primary goal of the coalition is to raise the level of awareness of the benefits of transit in the community. In addition, the coalition hopes to support the county commission in accomplishing the transit goals of the commission, including the attainment of state and federal funding for transit.

The coalition has been supported by MDTA staff in its efforts to organize. It is not an arm of MDTA; it is an independent organization that can help generate community support for Dade County transit projects. The goal of the coalition is not to set policy but to help promote the commission's policy. However, at some point it may need to determine what role it will play as an advocate for new policies or positions on transit initiatives.

34. **Support transit's interests at the regional, state and national levels.**

MDTA has been very active at all levels of governance in support of transit. At the state level, the MDTA director has served as president of the Florida Transit Association, while the agency has hosted that association's annual conference and annual bus maintenance rodeo. MDTA has taken the lead in creating of a state transit finance corporation to assist local transit agencies in major capital purchases. The MDTA director also serves as a member of the Board of Directors of the Center for Urban Transportation Research (a part of the University of South Florida), which is funded by the Florida Legislature to perform transportation research of statewide importance.

At the regional level, MDTA has worked very closely with FDOT to develop multimodal solutions to transportation problems. One spectacular example is the multimodal proposal to enhance the capacity of the east-west corridor by improving roads, rail, airports, and seaports. Dade County (while having a few differences) has been a firm supporter of Tri-Rail. In fact, MDTA has perhaps
been too generous in allowing Tri-Rail users unlimited use of Dade's transit system at no extra cost to the passenger. MDTA has offered to assist other transit systems in the region in establishing automated passenger information systems by utilizing its contract with Megadyne. It also took the initiative in establishing a task force to review and coordinate transit fare policies in the region through its familiarity with CUTR's capabilities.

At the national level, a number of MDTA staff serve as chairmen or active members of numerous APTA committees that set industry policy and share technical progress among industry members. Dade County Commissioners have testified before Congressional committees on behalf of transit projects in Dade and transit funding for the nation. The enormous letter writing campaign noted in Objective No. 33 clearly helped the cause of transit funding at the national level. MDTA served as host to APTA's annual rapid rail conference in 1993 and has been selected to serve as the host of APTA's annual bus technology conference to be held in 1997.

35. Develop a local initiative in concert with the Dade delegation to promote transit funding of both operating and capital improvement programs.

As reported under previous strategies, Dade County made a concerted effort to gain local support for federal transit funding as part of the legislative process leading up to the enactment of ISTEA in 1991. Since that time, the Dade County staff has worked diligently within the spirit and letter of ISTEA to develop an intermodal Program of Interrelated Projects (PIP) for Congressional approval. The PIP was submitted to the House Public Works Committee for authorization, signed by every House member in Dade County. There is at least one transit project in each Congressional Representative's district, and MDTA staff keeps each Representative's office well informed of the projects' status.

36. Promote cost-effective transit projects that meet technical and political requirements.

Constrained budgets have prevented MDTA from implementing as many transit projects as they had hoped. The agency has made considerable progress in spite of these limitations with a variety of projects since 1991. It is difficult to determine if “political requirements” are met since almost all projects will benefit some groups while displeasing others. On balance, the following projects were technically beneficial from a countywide perspective without causing extreme negative response:

- Cooperative agreements that provided jitneys the opportunity to operate in the south part of Dade County as part of the recovery efforts following Hurricane Andrew
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

- MAX limited express services placed along Northwest 27th Avenue, Flagler Street, and Biscayne Boulevard
- Parking facilities improvements at the South Miami and Dadeland North Metrorail stations
- The joint development agreement for the Dadeland North Metrorail station
- The 9th Street Pedestrian Mall Urban Initiatives project
- Mainstreaming of Medicaid paratransit users to fixed-route transit
- Utilization of supervised Corrections and Rehabilitation detainees to clean bus stops
- Addition of 400 bus benches throughout the county
- Completion of the Transitional Analysis Corridor Studies and the adoption of the Program of Interrelated Projects
- Executing responsibilities for all transportation issues concerning the Summit of the Americas and the Super Bowl
- Newspaper recycling at rail stations
- Construction of the Metromover extensions on time and under budget
- Purchase of articulated buses that expand capacity in well used transit corridors without increasing cost
- Establishment of a brokered paratransit service that encourages competition, expands minority vendor participation, and leads to more consumer choice

The only construction project that was subjected to extreme media scrutiny was the Peoplemover extension project. In spite of the very effective management of the project, its expense raised questions concerning its cost benefit in terms of how many new passengers it would carry and who would benefit.
STRATEGIC EXCELLENCE POSITION NO. 4: OPERATING PERFORMANCE

To provide effective service for our customers.

OBJECTIVES:

37. To improve on-time performance by October 1991 for bus by 20 percent, for rail by 5 percent and for STS by 30 percent.

Figure A-3 provides schedule adherence information for Metrobus and Metrorail from 1990 to 1994. Metrobus has improved its on-time performance by 12.5 percent between 1990 and 1994, by increasing from 64 to 72 percent schedule adherence. On-time performance for Metrobus is defined as being zero to five minutes late at a time point.

On the negative side, schedule adherence has declined from a high of 75 percent in 1992. On the positive side, an automated vehicle location system is being installed that should provide information that will help MDTA improve all bus route schedules. That system should immediately help the agency minimize the 11 percent of all trips that pass their time points early.

Rail has shown fairly steady improvement and maintained high standards, increasing its on-time performance from 90 percent in 1990 to 94 percent in 1994. Rail vehicles are considered “on-time” if they arrive at stations no more than 30 seconds earlier or 90 seconds later than their scheduled time.

The on-time performance of STS is more difficult to measure, since the parameters of determining schedule adherence have changed from 1990 to 1994. In 1990, on-time performance was 75 percent, as defined by arriving at pick-up points within 10 minutes before or 20 minutes after actual scheduled times (a 30-minute “window”). In 1994, on-time performance was measured at only 64 percent. However, the acceptable “window” defining on-time performance was reduced to only 15 minutes (no early arrivals permitted and only 15 minutes late allowed). It should be recognized that Dade County carried 1,500 more paratransit trips per day in 1994 than it did in 1990. There has also been the added challenge of transitioning to a new brokered system, putting the responsibility of scheduling trips on a new company not as familiar with the area as the prior company that had been doing the scheduling for the past 15 years.
No one is satisfied with a 64 percent on-time performance record. However, if an “apples and apples” comparison could be made between 1990 and 1994, the performance would be fairly close, given the tighter requirements in effect in 1994. This would still fall far short of the desired level of a 30-percent improvement in schedule adherence for paratransit services.

38. To improve mileage between lost service bus road calls from 10,000 to 15,000 miles.

In October 1990, with the implementation of the Transit Operations System (TOS), a more comprehensive means of reporting lost-time roadcalls was placed in operation. The introduction of this reporting feature demonstrated that the former reporting method did not capture all the roadcalls that were actually happening. As a result, the 10,000 miles between roadcalls was not an appropriate baseline value. The corrected baseline value was closer to 6,000 miles between roadcalls. Since this objective called for a 50-percent increase in the statistic, the corrected baseline would then be expected to be improved to 9,000 miles between roadcalls to satisfy the objective.
The results of this performance measurement are perhaps the most troubling to MDTA (Figure A-4). Two external factors contributed to the agency's weak performance in this objective. First, the county manager ordered a hiring freeze in response to the TWU's unwillingness to accept a two-tiered salary structure. This reduced the number of mechanics available to maintain buses as attrition slowly occurred. Second, it was determined that MDTA employees represented by TWU should be given the first opportunity to become rail maintenance personnel (over outside applicants) since they were “qualifiable” under the language of the 13(c) agreement. This caused a further shortage of bus mechanics as many moved to training programs and toward higher paying positions in rail vehicle maintenance.

These external factors were exacerbated by MDTA's adding more bus revenue vehicle miles as part of the recovery effort after Hurricane Andrew. This furthered the imbalance between demand for buses and supply of bus mechanics, particularly as a large portion of the fleet eligible for retirement (and more subject to service breakdowns) remained in service.

Figure A-4
Average Miles per Mechanical Roadcall

![Bar chart showing average miles per mechanical roadcall from 1990 to 1994.](chart)

Fiscal Year

Category
- Directly-Operated Metrobus

Strategic Excellence Position No. 4: Operating Performance
The average miles between mechanical roadcalls decreased by 60 percent, from 6,000 in FY 1991 to 2,400 in FY 1994 (Figure A-4). Changes in the top management of bus operations were instituted in November of 1994, and the general superintendent of Bus Maintenance now reports directly to the MDTA director. The entire organization needs to work together on every aspect (including bus service planning, human resources planning, labor relations, procurement, capital budgeting, training, etc.) that affects Bus Maintenance's ability to correct this disturbing trend. MDTA must re-emphasize the basics on behalf of its customers and in the best interest of maintaining the improved image it has worked so hard to earn since 1989. Maintenance is the foundation of any transit system. Poor equipment performance leads to loss of reliability and ridership, renders marketing almost useless, and seriously weakens the morale and performance of agency employees.

39. To improve the ratio of scheduled vehicle revenue hours actually worked to scheduled vehicle revenue hours from 97 to 98 percent for rail.

Metrorail has maintained an extremely high rate of service delivery. Statistics measuring this objective have been kept since 1992, shown in Table A-4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Service Scheduled (Trips)</th>
<th>Service Delivered (Trips)</th>
<th>Percentage of Delivered to Scheduled Trips</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>58,488</td>
<td>58,344</td>
<td>99.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>59,466</td>
<td>59,411</td>
<td>99.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>59,041</td>
<td>59,002</td>
<td>99.90%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Metromover performed in the following fashion (Table A-5):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Vehicle Hours Scheduled</th>
<th>Vehicle Hours Delivered</th>
<th>Percentage of Delivered to Scheduled Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>33,587</td>
<td>33,295</td>
<td>99.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>34,213</td>
<td>33,638</td>
<td>98.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>56,236</td>
<td>54,546</td>
<td>97.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The statistics above clearly show that Metrorail exceeded the goal of 98 percent for service delivered to service scheduled in all three years since 1992. Metromover did almost as well, falling short by 1 percent of the goal in 1994. Metromover experienced greater schedule irregularities in the initial months after the extensions were opened for service, as operating experience with the new software was obtained.

40. To achieve 100 percent of departures for bus, rail and mover.

Records on this objective were not readily available. However, the data provided in No. 39 above provides extremely similar information for Metrorail and Metromover. Those statistics show rail providing scheduled service between 99.75 and 99.9 percent of the time. Metromover performed at slightly lower levels, between 97.0 and 99.1 percent.

Metrobus keeps manual daily records of pullout performance. They are not easily summarized, but dispatchers are currently reviewing samples from throughout the past five years. Bus operation managers readily acknowledge that the goal of 100 percent departure for Metrobus was not achieved, particularly in 1993 and 1994. The Central and Northeast bus operations centers experienced the most difficulty meeting daily pull-out requirements. Such problems were most prevalent on weekday mornings, when as many as fourteen buses have pulled out late for service.

41. To achieve and sustain a maximum of one-day turnaround for minor defects.

MDTA's Bus Maintenance superintendent has advised that this statistic is not utilized for measuring performance and would require a considerable amount of work to retrieve. A review of the Metrobus Maintenance fiscal year reports for the past three years provides another indicator that ultimately affects MDTA's bus service quality. The percentage of on-time preventive maintenance inspections has generally declined since 1991, as follows (Table A-6):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Percent of On-Time Preventive Maintenance Inspections</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>89.93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>65.07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>86.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>83.40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Strategic Excellence Position No. 4: Operating Performance
Most transit agencies make every effort to maintain the recommended schedule for preventive maintenance inspections as a way of minimizing roadcalls and ensuring reliable service to the public. The downward trend in this performance indicator is, unfortunately, consistent with the negative trend in miles between roadcalls and complaints from the customers.

42. To improve aggregate system safety by 10 percent by October 1991.

System safety is taken quite seriously at MDTA. As noted in Strategy No. 27, MDTA has done very well when reviewed by FDOT and APTA for meeting system safety standards. Statistics from MDTA's “Transit Safety Annual Reports” indicate the agency has been holding fairly steady in many safety measures (Table A-7):

Based on the trends presented in Table A-7, the MDTA cannot claim a 10-percent improvement in aggregate safety. Virtually all figures show an increase in accident rates on vehicles, at stations and in the workplace from 1991 to 1994. While some of the percentage increases are quite high, the actual number of incidents remains fairly low.

There are many possible causes for transit accidents. MDTA might wish to review these statistics more closely to determine if more serious analysis and action is warranted. A peer analysis might provide some perspective on how well the agency is performing in this subject area.

43. To increase the number of telephone calls answered per transit information clerk-person-hour by 10 percent by May 1992.

The Transit Information Unit (TIU) of the Public Services Division was not able to provide a report on the status of this objective. The automated call distribution (ACD) reporting system in place since 1992 does not record this measurement. The statistic that comes closest is the TIU's hourly call processing rate. That rate has decreased from an average of 172 in 1992, to 167 in 1993, to 162 in 1994. This could be caused by vacancies in the TIU. However, managers within the Public Services Division believe that the method of supervision was the primary cause. In 1992 the TIU used “lead workers” on all shifts to provide supervision. These lead workers did not have organizational authority and were somewhat reluctant to report matters regarding their fellow clerks to supervisors. In 1993 and the early part of 1994, no supervisors were available for evening shifts and the lead worker concept was discontinued. The TIU fielded its lowest number of calls during these months when no effective supervision was available for certain shifts.
Table A-7
Safety Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bus Passengers' Accident Rate (per million passengers)</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>3.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-Board Bus Accident Rate (per million passengers)</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td>2.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bus Traffic Accident Rate (per 100,000 vehicle miles)</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>3.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail Train Accident Rate (per million car miles)</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metromover On-Board Accidents (per million passengers)</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail On-Board Accident Rate (per million passengers)</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail Station Accidents (per million passengers)</td>
<td>4.39</td>
<td>7.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metromover Train Accident Rate (per million car miles)</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metromover Station Accidents (per million passengers)</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Accidents (lost workdays per 200,000 work hours)</td>
<td>313</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Recordable Industrial Accidents</td>
<td>358</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the latter half of 1994, two full time supervisors were added to the TIU. The hourly call processing rate has increased noticeably from 152 per hour in the first half of the year to 173 per hour in the second half, in spite of having fewer total personnel in the latter half of the year. It is hoped that this continued method of supervision, combined with an automated voice response system (to be placed into full service in 1995), will result in significantly more calls handled per TIU person-hour.
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

44. To achieve and maintain a maximum hold time of two minutes for incoming calls.

The current ACD reporting system in the TIU keeps track of the average length of time people must wait and hold before their call is answered. The “wait time” for calls increased from 90 seconds in 1992, to 111 seconds in 1993, to 124 seconds in 1994. One might sadly conclude the objective of a two-minute hold time was achieved, but it was achieved through regression rather than improvement.

On the positive side, the TIU's performance in this objective improved dramatically during 1994 when more disciplined supervision was placed in the unit. Average wait time decreased from 149 seconds in the first quarter of 1994 to 106 seconds in the fourth quarter. Again, the installation of a new computer-assisted information system, currently being tested before being placed in full service in 1995, should reduce the average wait time to considerably less than 90 seconds per call. Future goals in this area might be structured more tightly. For example, MDTA customers would be better served if 80 percent of all callers waited no longer than 90 seconds to be assisted. An average 90-second wait time means that 50 percent of all customers will still wait more than 90 seconds for assistance.

45. To reduce the number of customer complaints by 10 percent by October 1991.

MDTA keeps track of complaints received through its Public Services Division. Figure A-1 (referenced in Objective No. 2) clearly shows the U-shaped pattern complaints have taken between FYs 1990 and 1994. The number of complaints did decrease by 10 percent between 1990 and 1991, thereby accomplishing the initial objective. Regrettably, the average number of complaints received each month (not including paratransit) increased by 51 percent between 1991 and 1994 (from 370 to 558). This increase in complaints far outpaces the ridership increases experienced during that same timeframe. Clearly, the missed trips, mechanical breakdowns and declining schedule adherence in bus service have created difficulties sufficient to cause people to complain more than any other time in the past five years.

Complaints about paratransit services have exploded, increasing by almost 200 percent from 1992 to 1994 (Figure A-2 in Objective No. 2). Paratransit ridership has increased and service standards have tightened. However, the massive increase in complaints is far greater than the percentage increase in ridership. The transition to a brokered system has not been without problems as the new private manager and new providers become more familiar with their responsibilities.
To increase boardings per vehicle revenue hour by 5 percent for rail and 6 percent for mover.

Metrorail has experienced steady growth in passengers per vehicle revenue hour from 1990 through 1993 (the most recent year for which Section 15 data is available). Metromover did not enjoy similar growth, experiencing a steady decline over the same timeframe. Figures on passengers per vehicle revenue hour for each mode are presented in Table A-8.

Table A-8
Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Percent Change 1990-1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail</td>
<td>76.1</td>
<td>77.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metromover</td>
<td>97.5</td>
<td>88.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Metrorail's ridership was assisted by the increase in regional travel following Hurricane Andrew, improved performance and by greater use of the service for special events (an MDTA marketing objective) at the Miami Arena and other locations such as the Lipton Open.

Metromover's operation was frequently interrupted by closures due to construction of the extensions. Starting in 1992, the outer loop was usually closed, and the inner loop's operations were terminated by 8:00 p.m. Consequently, it is impossible and inappropriate to draw any conclusions about ridership patterns for Metromover from 1990 to 1993.

STRATEGIES:

47. Analyze current and historical data to determine the root causes of: on-time performance failures; lost service road calls; passenger, traffic and employee accidents.

There are numerous reporting systems present at MDTA that have been improved since 1990. While they have varying degrees of sophistication and effectiveness, most of them provide valuable information for decisionmaking and detecting problems. It has been said by one author on strategic planning for transit (Gordon Fielding) that an agency cannot correct a problem unless it can first measure it. In most cases, MDTA is able to measure its performance and identify root causes of
problems. Where reporting systems are weak (e.g., Transit Information Unit monitoring), steps for improvement are being taken.

In spite of improved information systems, it does not appear that MDTA has had great success in accomplishing the specific elements of this strategy over the past three years. During that time, bus on-time performance has decreased, lost service road calls and passenger complaints have increased, and the rate of passenger, traffic and employee accidents has increased. There are many factors that contribute to these negative trends, some of which are external to MDTA. For instance, the pattern bargaining that typifies Dade County's approach to negotiating with various labor unions has hurt MDTA's abilities to accomplish its objectives. Decisions that might make sense from a broad county perspective have negative consequences for specific divisions like MDTA. For instance, the previous county manager's decision to freeze hiring during a disagreement with organized labor contributed to shortages in a number of areas, including bus maintenance.

The fact that MDTA is part of an enormous public bureaucracy (28,000 employees) has its drawbacks as well. Such organizations are as concerned with process and politics as they are with product. This can cause very slow response to problems once they are identified. Employees are not empowered to make decisions at the lowest possible levels within the organization.

These and many other legitimate reasons can be offered (insufficient resources, union intransigence, unfavorable arbitrations, etc.) for declining indicators that demonstrate that root causes of poor performance in certain areas have not been corrected. However, MDTA must honestly assess its own internal decisionmaking and style of teamwork as well. A frequent comment made during focus group meetings was the perceived parochialism that existed among managers. There was also a consistent call for better communication and a better sense of the agency's future. Goal statements touting the importance of the customer ring hollow when performance standards head in a negative direction. The failure to accomplish some of the basics associated with providing reliable bus service is almost surely a contributing factor to ridership that has decreased from the preceding year in four of the past five years.

There is a natural tendency for divisiveness in a large agency working out of six facilities, with many different areas of specialties, characterized by tremendous cultural diversity. A renewed sense of dedication toward customer service, improved communications and coordination, and clear objectives are some of the factors that can unite an agency to address the root causes of declining performance in certain areas.
48. Develop appropriate policies and procedures to minimize root problems.

An effective way to develop procedures for minimizing problems such as these is to develop task forces with various levels of employees involved in the development of solutions. For instance, in regard to on-time performance, more work needs to be done. Good schedule adherence is affected by scheduling, planning, bus stop locations, bus maintenance and availability, availability of personnel, marketing commitments, politics, road and traffic conditions, labor agreement provisions, etc. In short, almost a dozen transit specialties should be involved in one way or another with schedule development. It is a laborious process, particularly for an agency with 72 routes, but improved schedule adherence is fundamentally important and highly rewarding to employees and passengers alike. The automated vehicle location system will provide valuable information for scheduling and operations monitoring, but it will only provide a relatively small part of the information necessary to improve on-time performance.

A considerable amount of research has been done to identify different categories of lost service road calls. Biweekly meetings are held to discuss repeat road calls. Training and procedures for preventing certain types of road calls (e.g., overheating) have been instituted. Three factors have limited MDTA from improving its road call performance:

- Relatively slow replacement of old buses that are more subject to breakdowns
- Loss of bus mechanics due to earlier hiring freezes and movement to rail maintenance for higher paying positions
- The institution of more service miles at a time when there were shortages of mechanics to take care of an aging bus fleet

MDTA has successfully appealed for an exemption from the two-tier hiring system for bus mechanics. A career ladder program calling for extensive training in maintenance for existing employees regarded as “qualifiable” is also being developed. These steps will help, but more monitoring, coordination and action from related divisions in the agency will be required in the future to improve bus maintenance performance. The management of the Bus Maintenance Division has been changed, and now reports directly to the agency director.

The System Safety Program Plan has been instituted to provide procedures for a multitude of conditions. A new bus operators manual was produced and distributed in December of 1994, which reinforces guidelines and procedures for safe operations and passenger relations. A “Driver Check” program has been instituted for bus operations that encourages motorists to call the 800 number...
listed on stickers affixed to the rear bumpers of MDTA buses that ask “How’s my driving?” Sertec, the company receiving these calls, forwards the messages to MDTA for the purpose of counseling operators. Sertec promises to refund the fees for their service if Dade follows up on all calls and does not achieve a 10-percent reduction in accidents. In 1993 and 1994 MDTA did not follow up on all calls received, the accident rate did not decrease and MDTA continues to pay Sertec's fee in full.

49. Update and refine preventive maintenance programs.

Preventive maintenance forms and procedures have been redesigned and updated to include the FLxible advanced-design buses. Rail maintenance prides itself on its preventive maintenance program, but is concerned with its ability to perform all the minor and major rehabilitation of system components required as the fleet of heavy rail and Metromover vehicles ages. It should also be noted that the automated vehicle location system being installed can be programmed to have bus maintenance monitoring systems to detect conditions such as engines and transmissions about to overheat in buses that are in service.

Facilities and equipment other than buses and trains also require preventive maintenance on a scheduled basis. Procedures are in place to perform preventive maintenance on equipment such as HVAC systems, pumps, lifts, compressors, washers, cranes, lighting and fire protection systems. Escalators and elevators are maintained under private contract. While procedures are in place, the positions required to perform the maintenance functions have not been filled at a level to keep up with preferred schedules. The 13(c) requirement to provide opportunities to “qualifiable” TWU members has caused delays in filling vacancies with skilled people. These shortages have not yet contributed to lower levels of transit services to the public, but managers are concerned that further erosion in maintaining preventive maintenance schedules will ultimately affect service negatively. Field staff who participated in Strategic Management Plan update focus groups stated the same concerns.

50. Update and improve the condition of the following systems: traction power; computer-operated vehicle control; communications.

Since the adoption of the Strategic Management Plan in 1991, no significant changes or improvements to traction power systems have been required or made. The computer-operated vehicle control system in the Central Control facility has not yet gone through extensive change. While the current system performs the necessary functions, it is regarded as obsolete. Spare parts
are hard to find. Necessary improvements were planned to be installed in phases to keep within annual capital budgets. However, a report by ICF Kaiser recommended that the entire system needed to be changed at one time (a $17 million expense). MDTA is now evaluating how to accomplish this task given budgetary limitations.

The communications system is scheduled for significant improvements in 1995. A new 800-Megahertz radio system will be installed in all MDTA vehicles by the end of 1995. This system is part of a larger procurement that includes Dade's police and fire departments as well. The new radio system will be state-of-the-art, enhancing both voice and data channel capabilities. The capacity will be increased from the current six channels to 40 channels. The improvements to voice capabilities will benefit bus and train operators and all supervisors, provide greater clarity and reliability, and eliminate current "dead spots" that exist in some areas of the county. The enhanced data channels will be most helpful to Metromover and Metrorail. It can also allow bus maintenance personnel to electronically monitor certain mechanical conditions of buses in service such as engine and transmission temperatures, though these features will not be employed initially.

The new radio system will include an automated vehicle location system. The Global Positioning Satellite (GPS) technology used in the AVL system will allow bus dispatchers to monitor the schedule adherence and location of buses within 50 feet of their actual position. This system will provide many benefits, including greater operator and passenger security, reduced need for field supervisors to do manual schedule monitoring, better information for developing realistic schedules, better management control of field operations and more accurate information for the TIU on actual service conditions. It can also enhance the agency's abilities to monitor the performance of contracted vehicles to ensure compliance with service standards.

51. Maximize the percentage of paid time transit information clerks (TICs) are on the system.

The TIU managers have indicated that the current automatic call distribution (ACD) system does not readily record or generate this statistic. They are confident that the recently improved supervision noted in Objective No. 43 has resulted in clerks spending more time on the system. This anecdotal conclusion seems to be supported by the fact that the TIU's hourly call processing rate was significantly higher in the latter half of 1994, with the same or fewer number of clerks and approximately the same average talk time per call.
52. Maximize route productivity.

MDTA has been under considerable pressure to be as productive as possible in the recent past due to Dade County's millage cap restrictions and declining federal operating assistance. State Block Grant funding has increased from 1991 but leveled off in 1993 at approximately $13,000,000. In order to maintain existing levels of service and make minor improvements to the system, MDTA has had to generate additional farebox revenue. The agency has had considerable success in this effort, steadily increasing its self-generated operating revenue from $51,003,560 in FY 1990 to $64,256,000 in FY 1994. This increase in self generated revenue is partially attributable to an increase in the base fare from $1.00 to $1.25 in 1990. In addition, route modifications through the four-year period, and the introduction of limited express MAX services in three corridors, attracted more riders to the system. Total passenger trips by directly operated bus increased from 55,662,830 in FY 1990 to 63,806,510 in FY 1993 (according to the most recent Section 15 statistics).

Passenger trips per revenue mile increased from 2.88 in 1990 to 2.90 in 1993 (a 0.49 percent increase), while passengers per revenue hour increased 7.34 percent, from 33.30 in 1990 to 35.74 in 1993. While these increases are relatively modest in an area growing by 30,000 people a year, there were difficult circumstances to overcome. MDTA's need for more self-generated revenue resulted in the fare increase noted above. The fare increase not only discouraged ridership, but also provided added incentives for customers to use the services of illegal jitneys that focused their services on MDTA's most productive routes. This competition had a major impact on MDTA ridership, taking its heaviest toll in 1991 and 1992, before state law was changed to allow Dade County to strictly regulate jitney operations.

In addition, the vast majority of the growing population noted above has been locating in low-density areas in the western portion of the county not well served by transit. To attract this portion of the market requires extending existing routes further west or creating entirely new methods of service. In most cases, new transit services need at least a year to establish themselves, resulting in less impressive productivity measures in the early stages. A number of routes (8, 24, 40, 56, and 72) were extended further west while a new Route 104 was established to serve the western portion of the county. These extensions were done as economically as possible by using all available time from existing routes in the extensions. Changes to Route 56 proved to be particularly successful. These changes included extensions west and improvement to peak hour frequencies, resulting in ridership increases of 124 percent with an increase in service hours of only 40 percent.
Existing routes were reviewed on a continuous basis to identify possible duplication of service. For example, considerable operating dollars were saved when Route D in Miami Beach was discontinued, and Route K was extended to cover the area served by Route D. There were other opportunities to increase productivity by modifying the style of service provided in corridors. For instance, putting the Biscayne MAX service in place allowed MDTA to remove some tripper service buses from Route 3. This increased the hours of service modestly, but resulted in substantial increases in ridership in the Biscayne corridor.

It is not uncommon for politics to limit actions that could produce further efficiencies, or to cause the creation of service that is not based on efficiencies. Attempts to change Routes 48 and V were thwarted by such forces. For the most part, however, MDTA has enjoyed at least modest success in increasing route productivity under difficult circumstances.

53. Establish an effective overall quality assurance program.

Budgetary limitations delayed the hiring of positions for this program until 1992. To date, the two positions hired for this purpose have been assigned the priority of administering the installation of new fare collection equipment, particularly for the Metromover extension project.

Drafts of quality assurance manuals have been prepared, but not yet implemented. It is expected that the quality assurance program will start in the fall of 1995. The primary purpose of the unit is to assist all MDTA sections with the development of procedures, and then assure that those procedures are being followed.
STRATEGIC EXCELLENCE POSITION NO. 5:  
FINANCIAL/ADMINISTRATIVE PERFORMANCE

To provide service at the lowest possible cost within established budgetary and farebox recovery guidelines.

OBJECTIVES:

54. To operate within budget.

MDTA operated within the budget allocated by the county in FYs 1991, 1992 and 1993, though the margins in those years were very small. In FY 1994, MDTA's revenues fell short of expenditures by $3.2 million. A number of factors contributed to the FY 1994 deficit, including: increased insurance rates resulting from Hurricane Andrew; over $1,000,000 paid to TWU members as a result of a ruling on the interpretation of 13(c) provisions; a $2 million increase in paratransit expenses due to increased demand generated by ADA; and a reduction in anticipated farebox revenue partially attributable to optimistic projections and partially due to missed trips and higher complaints. MDTA utilized a portion of their FDOT Block Grant funds for 1995 to cover the deficit for FY 1994.

55. To maintain farebox recovery ratio above 35 percent throughout FY 1991.

As noted in Strategy No. 52, MDTA has experienced considerable pressure to generate as much revenue as possible due to capped county contributions, decreasing federal operating support and plateaued state assistance. The operating recovery ratios for FYs 1991 through 1993 are presented in Table A-9.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>1991</th>
<th>1992</th>
<th>1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fixed Guideway¹</td>
<td></td>
<td>27.40%</td>
<td>25.20%</td>
<td>25.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motorbus</td>
<td></td>
<td>40.00%</td>
<td>40.00%</td>
<td>41.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systemwide²</td>
<td></td>
<td>35.00%</td>
<td>35.00%</td>
<td>37.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹Includes Metrorail and Metromover  
²Excludes Paratransit
MDTA has enjoyed one of the better operating recovery ratios for bus service in the country. The recovery ratio for rail will remain relatively low until a complementary corridor of rail is constructed to provide additional rapid transit opportunities to other major trip attractors in Dade County. The figures above do not include paratransit expenses which have grown considerably since ADA became law. This legislation has particularly strong impact in south Florida where over 20 percent of the population is over the age of 65. Federal regulations prohibit transit agencies from charging more than twice the base fare (plus transfer) for paratransit trips, even though a paratransit trip might cost ten times more to provide than a trip provided by fixed route.

MDTA is an industry leader in “mainstreaming” paratransit users to regular fixed-route transit. These programs will need to be continued, and Dade County will need to be firm in providing service only within the required parameters of ADA if it hopes to keep paratransit expenses to a reasonable level.

It is virtually certain that federal operating assistance will be cut back even further starting in FY 1996 (as much as 47%). MOTA will need to earn more revenues or reduce costs to maintain the same level of services now provided. There will also be pressure from Dade County government for MOTA and all county agencies to identify savings or new revenues.

56. To maintain operating cost per passenger at 2 percent below the rate of inflation.

MDTA achieved this objective from 1990 through 1993. Table A-10 provides information on cost per passenger trip for bus, rail and automated guideway, as well as system total (minus paratransit and purchased motorbus).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Percent Change 1990-1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metrobus</td>
<td>$1.76</td>
<td>$1.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail</td>
<td>$3.08</td>
<td>$3.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metromover</td>
<td>$1.99</td>
<td>$2.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>System Total</td>
<td>$2.02</td>
<td>$2.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1Excludes purchased motorbus
The system total of 0.10 percent increase clearly represents an average significantly less than the annual rate of inflation. Table A-10 shows that the two primary modes (Metrobus and Metrorail) were particularly strong in this objective. The systemwide total was negatively affected by the construction of Metromover’s extensions, which reduced ridership on the automated guideway.

57. To reduce non-productive pay by 10 percent per year for the next two years (in the following categories): unscheduled absence; standby time; percentage of pay hours spent not driving; injury hours.

Figure A-5 illustrates the fairly steady trend of unscheduled (or unanticipated) absence at MDTA from FY 1990 to 1994. Over the five-year period, unanticipated absence increased slightly, from 7.1 to 7.2 percent.

![Figure A-5](image_url)

Absence Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Anticipated</th>
<th>Unanticipated</th>
<th>Combined Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Standby time increased for bus and decreased for rail (Table A-11):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Percent Change 1990-1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metrobus</td>
<td>48,614</td>
<td>44,083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail</td>
<td>4,456</td>
<td>5,084</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The percentage of pay hours spent not driving decreased for both Metrobus and Metrorail by more than 10 percent (Table A-12):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Percent Change 1990-1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metrobus</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrorail</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While information on injury hours was not readily available, the MDTA annual safety reports provide the number of lost workdays due to industrial accidents for the entire system (Table A-13):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Percent Change 1990-1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8,844</td>
<td>8,370</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MDTA accomplished its goal of a 10-percent reduction in the category of percentage of pay hours spent not driving, but did not reach the goal of a 10-percent reduction in any of the other categories of non-productive pay.

Strategic Excellence Position No. 5: Financial/Administrative Performance
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

STRATEGIES:

58. Improve operation of system fare policy.

MDTA requested CUTR's assistance on this subject in three different studies that resulted in three reports produced in 1994. The most significant report was entitled "Transit Fare Policies and Strategies". This report compared MDTA's fares to fares charged by peer transit agencies and offered recommendations for new fare policies that would be well received by customers.

The report demonstrated that MDTA's base fare is only slightly higher than its peers, but its monthly passes are significantly higher. MDTA's fare policy is structured under the principle of "deep discounting." Under this concept, base fares are kept at a relatively high level since those who use the system once a week or less are not terribly fare-sensitive. Monthly passes are kept at a relatively high level since frequent users will still enjoy savings and convenience by using the pass. (Surveys of passengers conducted by CUTR in 1993 indicated that monthly passholders make an average of 83 trips per month.) Discounted tokens offer lower cost opportunities for those who travel between one and five times per week. They are also attractive to those who cannot afford monthly passes. In addition, discounted tokens tend to encourage greater ridership since the tokens can only be purchased in bulk allotments. This fare policy is designed to maximize revenue in a way that still provides lower cost opportunities for passengers who can't afford the high cost of monthly passes.

CUTR's report recommended the establishment of a weekly pass as a further convenience for lower income, frequent passengers. It also recommended increasing the number of pass/token outlets and the implementation of a monthly Metromover pass.

Another CUTR report entitled "Metromover Extensions Transfer Analysis" recommended that the bus/mover transfer be treated in the same manner as the current rail/mover transfer, i.e., free from bus to mover and an "upgrade" fare (currently $1.00) from mover to bus. This recommendation was implemented in November 1994.

Finally, MDTA participated in a jointly funded effort entitled "Southeast Florida Regional Transit Fare Coordination Study." This report produced numerous recommendations on how fare policies could be coordinated between the four operating transit agencies (Broward County Transit [BCT], MDTA, Palm Beach County Transportation Authority [CoTran] and Tri-County Commuter Rail Authority [Tri-Rail]) to encourage greater use of public transit throughout the region. The report recommends Dade County do the following:

Strategic Excellence Position No. 5: Financial/Administrative Performance
• Eliminate upgrade charge from BCT bus
• Develop regional pass sales outlets with other systems
• Implement a daily regional pass with other agencies
• Implement a BCT/MDTA monthly two-county pass
• Enforce not allowing Tri-Rail passes to be used on services that do not feed the Tri-Rail system

The intent of the recommendations is to encourage greater use of public transit for regional travel.

59. **Formalize build/buy review process.**

This objective was developed to improve the process of purchasing items for MDTA's rolling stock. The intent was to establish a formal process for determining whether major components should be rebuilt in-house, contracted out or replaced with a totally new component. A formal process (with procedures memos and flow charts) was not developed, but there was ongoing coordination between Materials Management and Bus and Rail Maintenance Divisions. Most of the buses purchased since 1991 remain under warranty, obviating the need for decisions on whether to buy, repair in-house or contract out major components.

The number of buses that have been unavailable for service due to shortages of parts or components is quite small. The Materials Management Division keeps a “bus down ratio” that has shown the buses lost to service due to lack of parts has been less than one-half of 1 percent since 1991.

60. **Complete the second MIS Master Plan, a principal component of which includes implementing an accurate and timely information system.**

The second MIS Master Plan, designed to serve as a five-year planning and budgetary tool, was completed in 1992. An update is planned in 1995. This plan provided the outline for needed improvements to existing applications and a list of new applications. Some projects were not undertaken as a result of re-evaluation or budgetary constraints. However, progress has been made on the following applications:

- Personnel Automated Logging System (PALS) - PALS has automated personnel records processing such as personnel change documents, performance evaluations and recruitment requisitions. This system allows MDTA to electronically capture the information that is simultaneously being generated for hard copies that are kept for official county records.
software, which was created by MDTA personnel, allows storage and analysis of personnel activities that previously took extraordinary amounts of manual labor.

- **Customer Information System (CIS)** - This application (described in Strategy No. 5) has been developed and is being tested by the Public Services Division prior to full implementation expected in 1995.

- **Graphic Scheduling** - RFP responses for providing this advanced software are currently being reviewed. This application provides greater integration among blocking, runcutting and restoring databases. Optimization features choose the lowest cost solution within the constraints of labor agreement rules and practices. The primary purpose is to develop the most efficient bus operator line-up possible. Customization and installation is expected in 1995.

- An upgrade to the FAMIS grant cost accounting system has been implemented.

- **Executive Information System** - MDTA is currently completing the specification for developing a common database that all managers can access for current information on personnel, budget, financial statistics, performance statistics for various functions, etc.

61. **Improve the portion of paid hours consumed in productive activities.**

Please see Objective No. 57.

62. **Improve selected financial indicators.**

Five key financial indicators were selected by MDTA to represent fiscal efficiency. Table A-14 provides the record for each of these indicators from FYs 1990 to 1993:
These statistics are very positive and demonstrate excellent fiscal efficiency over a four-year time frame. Only the operating expense per capita experienced a noticeable increase, but the increase was consistent with the rate of inflation. The figures above reflect system totals excluding purchased motorbus and paratransit. This allows a better comparison of MDTA's performance without being skewed by the significant amount of temporary purchased transportation provided in south Dade after Hurricane Andrew.
STRATEGIC EXCELLENCE POSITION NO. 6:
PUBLIC/GOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS

To develop a positive awareness and understanding of public transit and to create a transit constituency through communication with governmental, civic and community groups and with the general public.

OBJECTIVES:

63. To achieve 75 percent of MDTA's agenda which requires governmental action.

As input to the federal efforts to establish a reauthorization of the Surface Transportation Act, MDTA developed a position statement in 1990 outlining its priorities for Congressional consideration. These positions were made known to legislators through letters and personal contacts. The specific positions and the resulting actions (*) included:

1. Retention of the use of federal general fund monies to supplement Highway and Transit Trust Fund monies to finance the transit funding program.
   
   * The federal government continued to supplement the Transportation Trust Fund with general funds to finance the federal transit program.

2. Increase the total transit funding program from $3.2 to $4.5 billion.
   
   * This objective was achieved, and by FY 1994 total federal funding for transit increased to $4.6 billion.

3. Expansion of the Rail Modernization funding program from $455 million to $600 million and allowing rail systems built after 1974 (like MDTA) to participate.
   
   * The Rail Modernization funding program became a formula program and included Dade County as a recipient. Total funding for this program increased from $455 million to $754 million in 1994, with Dade County receiving approximately $3.7 million annually.
4. Retention of federal funding for operating assistance to large metropolitan areas and allowing that level to increase with inflation.

* Federal transit operating assistance was retained from 1990 through 1994, but the national funding level was reduced by 12 percent in FY 1994, resulting in a $1 million reduction in operating assistance to Dade County.

5. Retention of the current federal funding participation ratios at 80 percent for UMTA Section 9 monies and 75 percent for UMTA Section 3 monies.

* Both Section 9 and Section 3 were reauthorized to provide for 80 percent funding from the federal level for local capital transit projects.

6. Expansion of the funding level for fixed guideway new starts to $600 million for the first year with growth over the reauthorization period.

* The funding level for new starts was expanded to $663 million nationwide. Dade County received $1 million for project development purposes for the north corridor project.

7. Expansion of the level of federal support for transit planning and research to at least three percent of the total transit funding program.

* ISTEA legislation included provisions for three percent of the total transit funding program to be used for planning and research.

MDTA staff has been active in other legislative issues as well. The reauthorization of ISTEA will address if areas that have reached Clean Air Act "attainment" or "maintenance" status will remain eligible for CMAQ funds. MDTA staff has worked diligently to persuade federal officials drafting the legislation to allow such areas (like south Florida) to retain eligibility through the full six years of ISTEA (through 1997) at funding levels available during the first three years of the program. This source of federal money provides over $20 million annually to Dade County. It is the primary source of funding for the South Dixie Busway, and a prominent portion of the funding for the Metrorail Palmetto Extension. It could help fund a number of other future projects as well.
MDTA was able to save from rescission up to $25 million in federal funds that remained from the Metromover extension project. Those funds are now expected to be available for the Metrorail Palmetto extension project. Funds for the Performing Arts Center Metromover station have been obligated, with a portion of the local match provided by The Miami Herald.

Progress continues to be made on all of the corridors included in the Program of Interrelated Projects. The north corridor and the east-west corridor are included in the Federal Transit Administration's 3J report. (Projects must be included in the 3J report to be eligible for Section 3 funding). One million dollars in Section 3 New Start money was appropriated to help complete the project development phase for the corridor. The north corridor is included in the House version of the National Highway System bill in 1995. In addition, both the House and Senate appropriations bills for FY 1996 provide $2 million for the north corridor.

Dade County has taken full advantage of the flexibility provisions of ISTEA and is proving to be a national trend setter in planning for intermodal projects. A Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between all the agencies of USDOT has been agreed upon for the planning and design of the transportation improvements to the east-west corridor. This MOU designates the Federal Highway Administration as the lead agency, identifies roles and delineates coordination rules for completing the NEPA process. The east-west corridor project is moving forward through the project development phase using FHWA funds.

Dade County officials have also been among the most active in influencing state legislation. They worked effectively with others throughout the state to finalize legislation creating the state Block Grant program in 1990. MDTA staff is currently working with peers throughout the state to draft legislation that would allow the funds for the transit Block Grant program to be indexed to inflation, allowing for future growth from this source of operating and capital funds.

MDTA staff provided consistent input to the drafting of legislation creating the Dade County Expressway Authority. That legislation allows revenues received by the Authority to be used for transit capital and operating expenses as well as highway projects. This could prove to be a critical source of future revenue, given the county's millage cap restrictions and the federal government's likely cutbacks after FY 1995.

MDTA has also received Local Agency Certification from FDOT and FHWA. This certification provides MDTA with the authority to commit highway funds to design and construction contracts without FDOT review and approval. It allows MDTA to manage projects funded through FHWA
as well as FTA. This will provide MDTA with better control of the design and construction of projects for which they will have ultimate operating responsibility.

64. To maximize the public's awareness and understanding of public transit services as defined and measured by periodic surveys.

Due to budgetary constraints, funds to conduct the surveys contemplated in this objective were never available. MDTA used BSR to conduct tracking studies in 1986, 1988, 1991 and 1994. Those surveys of 1,500 Dade County households were not specifically designed to thoroughly measure the public's awareness and understanding of public transit services. However, certain questions were asked that provide some measure of this objective. The survey asked questions designed to measure the changes in the image of Metro-Dade's transit system. The results of that research are included in Table A-15. Perhaps the most directly pertinent question was “Is Metrorail an asset to our community?” The aggregate score for the answer to this question rose positively from 1986 through 1994. However, the question dealt with only one mode of transit (Metrorail).

### Table A-15

**Changes in the Image of MDTA System**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Metrorail is an asset to our community.</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>3.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Metrorail is an efficient and fast means of transportation.</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>3.07</td>
<td>3.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Riding on board Metrorail is very safe.</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>3.03</td>
<td>2.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Riding on Metrobus is very safe.</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>2.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The transit parking areas are safe for cars and people.</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2.82</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>2.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>People waiting at Metrorail stations feel safe.</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>2.72</td>
<td>2.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>MDTA uses tax money wisely.</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>2.79</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td>2.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>MDTA changes bus routes much too frequently.</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>2.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Metrorail is being operated at the expense of Metrobus.</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>2.53</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Metrobus stops are generally quite safe places to wait.</td>
<td>2.35</td>
<td>2.64</td>
<td>2.61</td>
<td>2.47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Average of 10 Image Statements**

| 2.78 | 2.84 | 2.80 | 2.70 |

Scale: "Strongly Disagree" = 1.00; "Strongly Agree" = 4.00

Source: 1994 MDTA Tracking Study, Behavioral Science Research
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

The surveys conducted by BSR concentrated on attitudes toward service quality rather than transit's relative importance in the community. Perhaps this question can be included in future tracking studies.

65. To maximize the transit constituency which will improve public support for the transit program.

Presentations by MDTA staff members to a wide variety of groups and individuals in connection with explaining the November 1990 transit surtax referendum and the 1991 federal transportation funding reauthorization created a citizenry significantly better informed about transit. In excess of 50 presentations to Chambers of Commerce, homeowners associations, environmental groups, neighborhood groups, state and federal Congressional members, religious associations, human service organizations, charitable institutions and civic activist groups brought local transit concerns and plans to the attention of a large local audience.

The presentations relating to federal efforts to reauthorize transit funding legislation resulted in more than 6,000 letters being sent to Congress supporting the transit positions noted in Objective No. 63. Additionally, the staff support provided to former Commissioner Charles Dusseau at his regional mobility breakfasts enabled the further communication of transit goals and objectives to community leaders, elected officials and local business people.

Clearly, the most significant effort to maximize transit's constituency has been the assistance given by MDTA in developing the Transit 2020 Coalition. MDTA has hired staff with extensive community contacts and governmental experience to work directly with the Coalition in its efforts to organize itself and promote transit's agenda. Congressman William Lehman (former chairman of the House Transportation Appropriations Subcommittee, now retired) has also provided his considerable support in this area. The objectives and status of this organization are more fully described in Strategy No. 33.

MDTA's Marketing and Public Services Divisions constantly attempt to maximize the constituency for transit through their efforts to promote transit to targeted groups. One example is the program to teach second-grade school children the benefits of transit and how to use MDTA's services. Staff also works with major employers and local colleges to promote discount monthly passes. This helps gain support for transit among both employees and employers. MDTA staff assists transportation management associations in the Civic Center area and in Miami Beach. MDTA can leverage its
limited marketing resources by taking advantage of the focused energy TMAs provide in disseminating information on transit alternatives for area employees.

STRATEGIES:

66. Develop and implement an ongoing public information program.

MDTA provides public information in a variety of ways. All agency progress on services and programs is shared with the media through press releases and personal communications. MDTA representatives attend multiple community meetings to receive input and provide information on plans and programs. The Public Services Division schedules meetings twice a year in 19 locations throughout the county (for a total of 38 annual meetings) to solicit comments, suggestions and recommendations on transit services and projects. Representatives of numerous MDTA divisions usually attend these meetings. In addition to receiving community input, agency staff provide information on MDTA' services and major projects at these meetings. There has been special emphasis on providing information at booths at major community events (e.g., the Goombay Festival and the Coconut Grove Art Festival) in which MDTA serves as a co-sponsor.

Changes that will be made to routes and schedules are explained in brochures that are placed in transit vehicles and at transit stations and centers prior to their implementation. New transit customer service centers have been provided at the Omni transit center and Civic Center.

A considerable amount of information is disseminated through the Coalition, whose members can share it with people within the organizations they represent.

Five-minute videos demonstrating public transit's benefits are available to share with groups such as the Chamber of Commerce, Beacon Council, etc.

A large share of the Marketing budget goes towards the printing and distribution of transit maps and schedules. These transit publications are now distributed to many libraries and community activity centers. Sixty-five locations all over Dade County benefit from periodic deliveries of transit information. One-time bulk deliveries of transit publications are also available upon request. In addition, transit information is posted at 80 major transfer points. This information is updated as the need arises.
67. **Formalize a program to provide positive, timely and accurate information to the public, the Board of County Commissioners, the county manager and other decisionmakers.**

MDTA produces a number of excellent reports that are distributed to a variety of groups. The “M News” is the agency newsletter that is scheduled to be provided to agency employees and the public-at-large every two months. This publication provides updates on recent transit accomplishments and upcoming services and events. It includes photographs and occasional personal profiles in addition to the transit “news” stories. Since it is produced only every two months, it is not the most current method of providing information, but it includes major highlights throughout the year.

A two-page monthly executive summary is produced primarily for senior staff and top management. This summary provides information on ridership by mode, schedule adherence, customer comments, operating recovery ratio, and brief narratives on noteworthy developments. It is typically shared with the Chamber of Commerce.

A monthly ridership report for all modes is provided to the county manager, the county commissioners and senior staff. A weekly report (known as the “bullets report”) summarizes major developments throughout the agency. This is given to the county manager and appropriate assistant county managers. Senior staff receives the weekly report along with more in-depth weekly summaries from each MDTA division.

Quarterly reports are produced that provide information on numerous performance factors, including attendance, ridership, roadcalls, revenues, accidents, complaints, attendance and many more items. It also lists the status of major capital projects.

An annual report, patterned after the quarterly reports, is also published and available to any interested party. As noted in prior items, information on service changes are provided in brochures and placed in vehicles and at transit centers.

The agency director meets often with individual county commissioners. He also briefs the Transportation Committee at its monthly meetings and seeks approval of the Board of County Commissioners on various issues at their bimonthly meetings.
68. **Encourage consideration of transit's role in overall regional planning and development.**

Dade County is represented on the Tri-Rail Board of Directors, the only truly regional transportation agency in south Florida. MDTA staff keep abreast of the regional concerns of Tri-Rail through attending monthly meetings on feeder services, conferring with their county representatives on the Tri-Rail Board, and by participating in joint studies such as the “Regional Fare Coordination” report produced by CUTR (see Strategy No. 58).

Dade County is coordinating more closely with Broward County on two projects. Broward has agreed to fund a portion of the alternatives analysis currently being performed for the north corridor. This study will be done to a lesser level of detail than that which is being performed for the Dade County portion of the corridor. However, it is designed to measure the impact of extending the high performance alternatives for the north corridor another 10 miles into Broward County. In addition, MDTA and Broward County Transit representatives are developing reciprocal agreements for transporting paratransit passengers between counties.

MDTA had representatives at the South Florida Regional Planning Council's technical meetings on the development of a Strategic Regional Transportation Plan in the latter half of 1994.

MDTA staff has worked closely with FDOT District VI to develop intermodal solutions to transportation problems in southeast Florida. MOTA has been a key contributor to the concept of the Miami Intermodal Center at Miami International Airport. This transportation facility is intended to accommodate virtually all modes of transportation, including high-speed rail which would serve the Tampa-Orlando-Miami corridor. A high speed train would provide further linkages of regional airports, encourage more regional travel by transit and encourage development around high-speed rail stations. FDOT has been highly supportive of providing priority to transit over new major highways. While much of this is due to FDOT Secretary Ben Watts' encouragement, a good portion is also due to the cooperation and initiative of the MDTA staff.

69. **Encourage senior staff to become more involved in community activities.**

This strategy was initially developed by MDTA as a means of "giving something back" to the community. It also was part of a broader strategy to spread transit's message to various elements of the community. This was particularly important prior to the referenda on transit surtaxes. The referenda failed in 1990 and 1991. In 1992, Hurricane Andrew disrupted the lives of many senior...
staff, allowing very little time to contribute to community activities. The failed referenda and the aftermath of the hurricane caused a decreased emphasis on this objective.

In addition, the Transit 2020 Coalition was started in 1993, serving as a more effective way of penetrating the community with transit’s message. Some senior staff have been contributors and participants in community activities. However, there was no requirement to do so, and little effort was made to follow up on this strategy.

70. Develop a mechanism to answer complex policy-related questions in a timely and accurate manner.

No formal process was created to accomplish this strategy. Top management meets once a week to deal with issues of all degrees of complexity. The agency director approaches complex problems by breaking them down to their component parts to simplify the process of developing solutions.

71. Work with the State of Florida in developing meaningful performance measures and criteria.

In working with CUTR, MDTA contributed to the development of a set of performance measures adopted by the state for annual reporting beginning in 1992. The agency's performance, as defined by these measures, must be published in a newspaper of general circulation in March of each year. This requirement was passed by the state as a compromise with those who wanted to make the availability of state transit funding dependent on transit systems meeting certain performance measures.

72. Work with the Florida Transit Association to establish a program to inform the state legislature of transit's effectiveness.

Dade County is a long-standing member of the Florida Transit Association (FTA), and a permanent member of the Board of Directors. The FTA has a full-time executive director and an adopted budget that includes funds for producing literature, videos or other materials to promote transit's benefits. MDTA has regularly contributed to FTA's quarterly newsletter that includes positive stories about transit from throughout the state, and is sent to all state legislators. The agency has also contributed graphic support and visual aids toward the production of presentations. In addition, MDTA has assigned personnel when necessary to meet individually with state legislators and their staff whenever required for promoting state support for transit.
73. **Continue to consider a new unified image for MDTA.**

Most MDTA staff members who participated in focus groups for the Strategic Management Plan update agreed that the agency's image was greatly improved from five years ago. It enjoys a very solid image with state and federal transportation agencies. Table A-15 (from the 1994 Tracking Study conducted by BSR) indicates that a growing percentage of households in Dade County think that Metrorail is an asset to the community and that the MDTA uses tax money wisely.

The numerous reports noted in Strategy No. 67 have provided information allowing agency staff to become more familiar with the activities and performance of the agency. Orientation sessions provided on a quarterly basis provide opportunities to properly inform new employees of the agency's mission and emphasis. The strategic plan will provide a more unified focus for the most critically important tasks ahead.

In spite of all this legitimate progress, there is still anxiety within the agency over insufficient unity and coordination. The vast majority of focus group participants were not satisfied with the quality of communication. They also cited parochialism among top management as one of the agency's weaknesses. Again, there is a tremendous opportunity for divisiveness in a transit agency, especially a large one operating from many facilities in a multi-cultural community. There needs to be frequent communication re-emphasizing priorities. The Kaset study noted a desire for more information on agency direction.

As noted above, there is a great deal of information flowing throughout the organization. What might be missing is an effort to crystallize the vast amounts of information that is generated from meetings, reports and consultants' recommendations. Perhaps more frequent messages from the director or a designated public information officer providing a clearer sense of agency purpose (the big picture) could increase the sense of a unified MDTA considerably. MDTA must be internally unified if it hopes to gain community support for more funding for transit.
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

STRATEGIC EXCELLENCE POSITION NO. 7:
CAPITAL CONSTRUCTION

To achieve ongoing planning, designing and construction of top quality, attractive transit projects on time and within budget.

OBJECTIVES:

74. To complete the Transitional Study with active UMTA participation for a ranking of priority corridors by December 31, 1991, and conduct alternatives analysis within one year of Board of County Commissioners approval.

The Transitional Study examined transportation demand in six different corridors in Dade County, and analyzed the number of passengers that would utilize a number of high performance transit alternatives. The study was completed and accepted in 1993. An Alternatives Analysis (AA) was started for the north corridor, while the Project Development and Environmental Analysis (FHWA's equivalent of AA) was started for the east-west corridor and the Metrorail Palmetto Extension project. An exclusive Busway, scheduled for completion by the end of 1996, is under construction in the south corridor from Dadeland South to Cutler Ridge. A transit service study is being done for the northeast section of the county to further define the transit needs and priorities of the northeast corridor. A similar study is being performed for the Kendall corridor. The Transitional Study projected the northeast corridor could support an exceptionally efficient Busway but also projected the Kendall corridor would not be able to efficiently support any high performance transit alternative.

The Transitional Study did not identify priorities among corridor projects. There was a deliberate decision by Dade County to avoid designating priorities. The strategy has been to include all the possible corridor improvements in a Program of Interrelated Projects (PIP). This program does not establish a rigid implementation schedule for separate projects. The PIP relies on a variety of funding sources, taking advantage of the new flexible funding provisions of ISTEA. Different levels of progress can occur in all the corridors simultaneously, utilizing multiple sources of federal, state and local funds. The implementation sequence should be driven by a practical approach based on the availability of funds and the continued validity of, and support for, identified projects. This strategy has worked well to date, as progress is being made in all six corridors at this time. The
overriding goal is to complete all projects in a time frame consistent with the Long-Range Transportation Plan for the year 2010.

**75. To develop a program for small capital improvements by March 31, 1991.**

Programs for small capital improvements are produced each year as part of the development of the capital budget. MDTA categorizes proposed projects into three different levels of commitments. The first level (receiving highest priority) includes bus replacements, projects that are legislatively mandated (e.g., capital improvements required by the ADA), projects that defer operating costs or promote safety and projects that satisfy contractual obligations such as multi-year procurement or environmental remediation efforts.

The second level of commitment includes projects that generally require scheduled maintenance or replacement on a continual basis. Examples of these types of capital projects include replacement of service vehicles, office equipment such as computers or copiers, fareboxes, tools or other major equipment.

The third level of commitment includes projects that would improve the transit system, but may not be absolutely necessary to ensure reliable service. Examples of these types of projects include closed circuit television cameras in passenger vehicles, concession facilities, signage, etc. Candidate capital expenditures are described and nominated by sponsoring MDTA divisions, ranked and weighted by an Executive Committee of MDTA and prioritized according to expected funding levels. The first level of commitment generally accounts for approximately 70 percent of all capital funding, and could easily account for more in certain years depending on priorities. Outside consultants, available through contracts administered by the Engineering and Construction Directorate, are sometimes used to determine the feasibility of requested projects. Their expertise helps provide more realistic estimates for the expense of projects that might cost much more than originally thought. This has improved the agency’s ability to develop realistic capital programs. MDTA has also stressed to all staff members the importance of careful projection of capital needs for at least five years into the future.
76. To develop and implement a funding program to support the capital construction program by March 31, 1991.

The Program of Interrelated Projects identifies the funding needs and likely sources for the 15-year period between 1995 and 2010. Current projections indicate a total cost of approximately $3.8 billion. Of this amount, 25 percent of all funds would come from FTA sources, 26 percent would

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Component</th>
<th>FTA Funds</th>
<th>State and Local Gov’t Funds</th>
<th>Other Funds</th>
<th>Total Project Funds</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A1 East-West/M.I.C.</td>
<td>$412,000</td>
<td>$560,000</td>
<td>$428,000</td>
<td>$1,400,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A2 M.I.C./836 Ramping</td>
<td></td>
<td>$14,000</td>
<td>$56,000</td>
<td>$70,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A3 Depress I-395</td>
<td></td>
<td>$68,000</td>
<td>$272,000</td>
<td>$340,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A4 Auto Tunnel to Seaport</td>
<td></td>
<td>$52,000</td>
<td>$208,000</td>
<td>$260,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;A&quot; Subtotal</td>
<td>$412,000</td>
<td>$694,000</td>
<td>$964,000</td>
<td>$2,070,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Kendall Corridor</td>
<td>$125,000</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
<td>$475,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1 North Corridor Rail Extension</td>
<td>$401,940</td>
<td>$172,260</td>
<td></td>
<td>$574,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2 Palmetto 27th Avenue Ramping</td>
<td>$4,000</td>
<td>$16,000</td>
<td>$20,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;C&quot; Subtotal</td>
<td>$401,940</td>
<td>$176,260</td>
<td>$16,000</td>
<td>$594,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D North-East Corridor Busway</td>
<td></td>
<td>$17,476</td>
<td>$69,903</td>
<td>$87,379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1 Palmetto Rail Extension</td>
<td>$25,000</td>
<td>$15,320</td>
<td>$36,280</td>
<td>$76,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2 Palmetto 74th Street Ramping</td>
<td>$4,800</td>
<td>$23,200</td>
<td>$28,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;E&quot; Subtotal</td>
<td>$25,000</td>
<td>$20,120</td>
<td>$59,480</td>
<td>$104,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F1 South Corridor Rail Extension</td>
<td></td>
<td>$310,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$310,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F2 Double-Track/Grade-SEP Upgrade</td>
<td></td>
<td>$200,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;F&quot; Subtotal</td>
<td>$0,000</td>
<td>$0,000</td>
<td>$510,000</td>
<td>$510,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>$963,940</td>
<td>$1,007,856</td>
<td>$1,869,383</td>
<td>$3,841,179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of Total</td>
<td>25.09%</td>
<td>26.24%</td>
<td>48.67%</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table A-16
Dade County Program of Interrelated Projects

1Preliminary, January 1994

Strategic Excellence Position No. 7: Capital Construction A-81
be through state and local sources, while 49 percent of all funds required would come from other sources such as those traditionally used on highway projects (Table A-16). The east-west corridor would be partially funded through passenger facility charges at the airport, which were approved by FAA effective January 1, 1995.

The flexibility provisions of ISTEA and the intermodal policies of FDOT provide encouraging opportunities for funding many of these ambitious plans. In addition, the PIP is highly consistent with the spirit of ISTEA, and the Miami Intermodal Center has received favorable comments from prominent federal officials. Many challenges remain. The federal and state governments are both reviewing ways to reduce governmental expenses. Dade County no longer enjoys the advantages of having a Congressional delegation with high seniority or powerful committee chairmanships. The largest challenge will be to develop the local funding that must be obtained in order to match federal funds, if federal funds are still available. Dade County still has no dedicated source of locally generated funds to serve as sufficient match for federal grants of the magnitude required to fund the projects included in the PIP. The local option gas tax approved in 1993 falls far short. There is little enthusiasm for increased local taxes, and recent referenda for infrastructure and public safety improvements in Dade County have failed.

The Busway between Dadeland South and Cutler Ridge is fully funded, and most of the funds required to complete the Palmetto extension of Metrorail are available. Sufficient local funds could probably be obtained to serve as match for state and federal funding of additional busway projects. However, other rail projects such as the north corridor and east-west corridor will not go forward unless a new source of local funds can be secured.

**STRATEGIES:**

77. Effectively prioritize short- and long-term corridor activities to assure continuity of the capital construction process and an overall schedule.

Please refer to Objective No. 74. Dade County has adopted the strategy of not prioritizing projects within the Program of Interrelated Projects for practical financial and policy reasons.
78. Establish a funding program to achieve the development schedule.

As Table A-16 shows, a fundamental outline exists that defines the total funding that will be required to complete the PIP. Lining up the funding will be an ongoing effort for Dade County. It will require continuous efforts to work closely with state and federal officials, elected officials, and members of the Transit Coalition. It is very likely that the year for completing implementation will extend well beyond the year 2015.

79. Establish a comprehensive project management system which includes quality assurance/quality control, cost monitoring and control, project schedules, etc.

MDTA installed a Primavera Project Management scheduling software package to monitor all capital projects. This software works in the personal computer environment and has been used for managing all projects since 1991, including the Metromover extensions, the South Miami Metrorail station parking garage expansion, construction of inspection pits at the central bus facility, removal of contaminated soil, replacement of roofs of Metrorail buildings, etc. Management actions to control the projects are being accomplished based on system reports. MDTA has enjoyed great success in managing projects that have been completed within schedule and budget.

80. Monitor and control design activities to insure cost-effective, aesthetically pleasing and safe design that satisfies transit needs.

A comprehensive system to monitor and control design activities throughout the life of any project has been in place since 1991. MDTA staff monitors all consultant contracts very carefully, reviewing the status of each contract on a weekly basis. A Change Review Board analyzes all changes proposed by consulting engineers to determine their cost/benefit and aesthetic nature. MDTA's project management capabilities were identified as an agency strength by a consensus of MDTA personnel who participated in focus groups as part of the Strategic Management Plan update.

81. Continue active participation in transit-related joint sponsored activities.

MDTA has had a considerable amount of recent success in the area of joint development. Utilizing its interlocal agreement with the University of South Florida, MDTA was able to secure the services of Greg Jones, a national expert in the subject of joint development within transit facilities. With the assistance of Mr. Jones and the cooperation of many other county agencies, MDTA was able to arrange a lease for a multi-phase joint development project at the Dadeland North Metrorail station.
that was approved by the county commission in April of 1994. The project will include 319,000 square feet of retail space, a 300-room hotel, and an office building. Construction is expected to begin by October of 1995. This lease is structured to generate a minimum of $40 million for Dade County over the 90-year life of the lease. The Request for Proposals prepared for this project will also serve as a model for future RFPs for a number of other sites in the transit system. In 1995, MDTA staff expects to issue RFPs for other developable sites, including Coconut Grove and Douglas Road. An agreement to continue to work with Mr. Jones for two more years has been executed.

A recent example is the RFP being prepared for the First Street Metromover Station located in the center of downtown Miami. MDTA hopes to attract development which generates revenues and ridership, and provides other benefits for the convenience and comfort of transit riders. In accordance with the county commission's stated policy for this site, proposals containing a housing component will receive preference.

On July 27, 1994, the county commission approved an agreement with Mount Sinai Hospital to build a joint-use multi-modal transit facility on the hospital grounds. The facility will house a transit terminal, a joint-use parking garage, and a rehabilitation center for the hospital. The transit elements of this project will be financed through a grant from the FTA. The cost of the transit facility will be approximately $3 million. The hospital will donate the land which will be used as the local match for the grant. Staff is currently preparing an RFP for the preliminary design of the facility. It is expected that construction will commence in late 1996. MDTA has received a proposal to develop approximately five acres of vacant land adjacent to the Allapattah Metrorail station. The proposed project comes from a community development corporation that is interested in building low-to-moderate income, single-family housing on the site. During 1995, staff will either negotiate with the aforementioned developer or solicit proposals to develop this site.

MDTA staff has been working with the State of Florida and its consultants to design the PALTRANS station which will be built at the northern terminus of the Metrorail system to facilitate joint development of the site. Future efforts for this project will be concentrated on identifying and recruiting potential joint development partners and designing the station in a manner which will maximize passenger convenience and accommodate joint uses. There is now concern that FDOT will not fund or build dedicated ramps for traffic to access the parking facility from the Palmetto Expressway.
Another example of a transit-related joint sponsored activity is the agreement with Miami Dade Community College to allow transit users to park at MDCC facilities. This agreement applies to the MDCC North and South campuses and costs MDTA only $1 per year.

82. **Provide opportunities for minority consultants and contractors.**

The Federal Transit Administration requires all transit agencies to closely examine each contract and establish attainable goals based on a reasonable expectation of participation by disadvantaged businesses. MDTA must then administer the contract in such a way that good faith efforts are made to accomplish the disadvantaged business enterprise (DBE) goals.

MDTA’s DBE Administration forwards to the county’s Department of Business and Economic Development (DBED), for approval, the DBE goal for each project and the DBE participation program submitted by the apparent low bidder and the selected proposers. While this review can add several months to the time necessary to start a project, it is essential under administrative orders of the county manager and consistent with the expressed desire of the Dade County Commission for bids and proposals to generally reflect the composition of the community. DBED also reviews and issues letters of certification to DBE firms examined by MDTA as well as its own staff. DBED now lists 881 firms as certified disadvantaged business enterprises.

The goals for construction projects vary from 10 to 35 percent. Professional services contracts usually require 35 percent participation. Virtually all of MDTA’s projects have met the established goals for a number of years.

In four contracts totaling more than $82 million for the construction of two extensions of Metromover, the DBE participation was nearly $36 million (almost 44 percent). For the same project, the professional services contracts for design, engineering and construction management totaled more than $15 million, of which DBE firms performed more than 35 percent of the work.

MDTA also contracts with private firms for specialized transportation services using vans, small buses, and automobiles. DBE firms are handling 25 to 30 percent of this work. For security services for transit facilities, a Black-owned security firm has a subcontract for 30 percent of a $35 million contract over the next five years.
83. **Assure that transit capital investments are consistent with other infrastructure investments.**

MDTA's capital program, which includes all the transit capital investments that are expected to be undertaken over the following five years, is included as part of the county's overall capital program. As such, all transit projects are subject to the county manager's central review where coordination with other projects is enhanced. All MDTA capital projects must also be included in the FDOT Transportation Improvement Plan (TIP). The development of the TIP is reviewed by both state and county staff where another level of review and coordination occurs.

MDTA staff participate in the review of development proposals at the Development Impact Committee level and at the South Florida Regional Planning Council level. These proposed developments are reviewed to ensure consistency with transit plans and projects. One example of where this has resulted in modifications to the development is the expansion proposals for Dadeland Mall. The developer performed additional analysis of mode splits and realized the significant number of people accessing the mall by transit. The expansion project will now include a covered pedestrian walkway from the eastern-most portion of the project to the Dadeland North station.

84. **Implement a rating/ranking process for smaller projects in terms of priority.**

Please see Objective No. 75.
EXHIBIT 1
MDTA PARTIAL STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK
MDTA Strategic Management Plan Update 1995

Strategic Excellence Positions

- **Market Needs**
  - To provide transit solutions to meet the specific identified needs of a diverse market within the context of the overall transportation system.

- **Human Resources**
  - To provide a productive, participatory, safe, challenging and enriching work environment which provides equal opportunity to all employees who work towards achieving a common vision.

- **Funding**
  - To obtain inflation sensitive, growing, long-term sources of revenue capable of fulfilling the 30 year implementation program.

- **Operating Performance**
  - To provide effective service for our customers.

- **Financial/Administrative Performance**
  - To provide service at the lowest possible cost within established budgetary and farebox recovery guidelines.

- **Public/Governmental Relations**
  - To develop a positive awareness and understanding of public transit and to create a transit constituency through communication with governmental, civic and community groups and with the general public.

- **Capital Construction**
  - To achieve ongoing planning, designing and construction of top quality, attractive transit projects on time and within budget.

Objectives

- **To increase per capita ridership systemwide by 3.5% for bus and 4% for rail by October 1991.**
- **To improve customer satisfaction by 10% by June 1992 as measured by a baseline study.**
- **To increase transit's share of passenger trips.**
- **To have a complete model of the mobility needs of Dade County residents that is not more than three years old by 1993.**

- **To demonstrably improve MDTA's work force by June 1, 1992.**
- **To improve upon a set of baseline measures, employees' perceptions regarding constructive discipline and reward, morale and job safety factors by 1992.**
- **To achieve objectives stated in the affirmative action plan.**

- **To improve on-time performance by October 1991 for bus by 20%, rail by 5%, and STS by 30%**
- **To improve mileage interval between lost service bus road calls from 10,000 to 15,000 miles.**
- **To improve the ratio of scheduled vehicle revenue hours actually worked to scheduled vehicle revenue hours from 97% to 98% for Rail.**
- **To achieve 100% of scheduled departures for bus, rail, and mover.**
- **To achieve and sustain a maximum one day turnaround for minor defects.**
- **To improve aggregate system safety by 10% by October 1991.**
- **To achieve and maintain a maximum hold time of 2 minutes for incoming calls.**
- **To reduce the number of customer complaints for 10% by October 1991.**
- **To increase boardings per vehicle revenue hour by 5% for rail, and 6% for mover.**

- **To operate within budget.**
- **To maintain farebox recovery ratio above 35% throughout fiscal year 1991.**
- **To maintain operating cost per passenger at 2% below the rate of inflation.**
- **To reduce non-productive pay by 10% per year for the next two years.**
- Unscheduled absence
- Standby time
- Percentage of pay hours spent not driving
- Injury hours

- **To achieve 75% of MDTA's agenda which requires governmental action.**
- **To maximize the public's awareness and understanding of public transit services as defined and measured by periodic surveys.**
- **To maximize the transit constituency which will improve public support for the transit program.**

- **To complete the Transitional Study with active UMTA participation for a ranking of priority corridors by December 31, 1991 and conduct alternatives analysis within one year of BCC approval.**
- **To develop a program for small capital improvements by March 31, 1991.**
- **To develop and implement a funding program to support the capital construction program by March 31, 1991.**
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

STRATEGIES

- Focus on providing accurate and reliable customer information in a "user friendly" format and obtain feedback on its usefulness.
- Follow-up on positive and negative feedback relating to employee actions impacting customer relations and satisfaction.
- Develop and implement a coordinated, fully integrated transportation system with easy transfers between transit modes and other elements of the area's transportation system.
- Obtain more effective and focused market information (quantitative data, focus groups, O/D surveys, and surveys of non-rider segments) to better understand the market's needs.
- Obtain and maintain better planning data such as ridership by segment, trip, etc.
- Market transit's impact on people's mobility.
- Provide real-time transit incentives (public and private) for peak and off-peak hour travel.
- Promote prudent use of the car as part of the overall transit campaign.
- Implement necessary interim steps to improve the telemarketing program.
- Review historical marketing strategies and utilize results to improve future strategies.

- Define training requirements for all classifications and implement a comprehensive training program.
- Adopt common uniforms as appropriate to position and level.
- Conduct a comprehensive baseline and follow-up employee satisfaction surveys.
- Publish a comprehensive discipline and counseling program.
- Develop and implement a responsive and achievable affirmative action plan.
- Negotiate a more flexible union contract to eliminate inefficient work rules.
- Identify work elements with high costs which should be contracted out and take appropriate action.
- Evaluate "correct" staffing levels.
- Continue implementation of System Safety Program Plan.
- Require management accountability and authority for budgetary performance and establish formal linkage between system-wide performance standards, divisional budgets, MBO comments and compensation.

- Pursue a dedicated source of funding.
- Support a broad coalition of interest groups in Dade County who would support transit.
- Support transit's interests at the Regional, State and National levels.
- Develop a local initiative in concert with the Dade Delegation to promote transit funding of both operating and capital improvement programs.
- Promote cost-effective transit projects that meet technical and political requirements.

- Analyze current and historical data to determine the root causes of:
  - On-time performance failures
  - Lost service roadblocks
  - Passenger, traffic, and employee accidents
  - Customer complaints
- Develop appropriate policies, procedures, systems and organizational infrastructures to minimize and/or eliminate the root causes identified above.
- Update and refine preventive maintenance programs.
- Update and improve the condition of the following systems:
  - Traction power
  - Computer operated vehicle control
  - Communications
- Maximize percentage of paid time Telephone Information Clerks are on the system.
- Maximize route productivity
- Establish an effective overall quality assurance program.

- Improve operation of system fare policy.
- Formalize "build/buy" review process.
- Complete the second MIS Master Plan, a principal component of which includes implementing an accurate and timely information system.
- Improve the portion of paid hours consumed in productive activities.
- Improve selected financial indicators.

- Develop and implement an ongoing public information program.
- Formalize a program to provide positive, timely and accurate information to the public, the Board of County Commissioners, the County Manager and other decision makers.
- Encourage consideration of transit's role in overall regional planning and development.
- Encourage senior staff to become more involved in community activities.
- Develop a mechanism to answer complex policy-related questions in a timely and accurate manner.
- Work with the State of Florida in developing meaningful performance measures and criteria.
- Work with the FTA to establish a program to inform the State Legislature of transit's effectiveness.
- Continue to consider a new unified image for MDTA.

- Effectively prioritize short and long-term corridor activities to assure continuity of the capital construction process and an overall schedule.
- Establish a funding program to achieve the development schedule.
- Establish a comprehensive project management system which includes QA/QC, cost monitoring and control, project schedules, etc.
- Monitor and control design activities to assure cost-effective, aesthetically pleasing and safe design that satisfies transit needs.
- Establish active participation in transit-related joint sponsored activities.
- Provide opportunities for minority consultants and contractors.
- Assure that transit capital investments are consistent with other infrastructure investments.
- Implement a rating/ranking process for smaller projects in terms of priority.
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES

Bibliography


3. Section 15 Summary Reports for FYs 1990-1993, Center for Urban Transportation Research

4. **MDTA Strategic Management Plan Executive Summary**, Ernst and Young, January 1991


7. **Metro-Dade Transportation Plan and Improvement Priorities, Long Range Element (To the Year 2010)**, Metropolitan Planning Organization, November 1991


10. **Comprehensive Development Master Plan for Metropolitan Dade County, Florida**, Metropolitan Dade County Planning Department, April 1993


12. Program of Interrelated Projects, MDTA, January 1994

14. 1994 Tracking Study of Transit Usage Patterns, Satisfaction and Image Among Rider and Non-Rider Populations in Dade County, Behavioral Science Research, September 1994


19. New Employee Orientation Program, 1994, MDTA


22. Metro-Dade Transit Agency Transit Fare Policies and Strategies, Center for Urban Transportation Research, August 1994

23. MDTA On-Board Survey Analysis, Center for Urban Transportation Research, May 1994


25. Bikes-on-Bus Service Delivery in Dade County: Suitability and Feasibility, Center for Urban Transportation Research, June 1994


27. Jitney Enforcement Strategies, prepared for MDTA by the Center for Urban Transportation Research, September 1995
APPENDIX A: EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE - 1991 SMP OBJECTIVES


